

Westfälische Wilhelms-Universität Münster

University of Twente

1<sup>st</sup> supervisor: André Krause, M.A.2<sup>nd</sup> supervisor: Prof. Dr. Marcel Boogers

Fallsemester 2015/2016

**Bachelor Thesis**

# Alternative vs. traditional tendencies as defined by Christian Fuchs in German, Dutch and British newspa- pers during the refugee crisis 2015

A comparative case study in search for  
counter-movements

Miriam Schröer

Student numbers

Universiteit Twente: 1614797

Westfälische Wilhelms-Universität Münster: 396461

Address: Dorotheenstraße 8, 33615 Bielefeld, Germany

Telephone: +31687951526

E-mail: m.schroer@student.utwente.nl

# Content

1. Introduction .....	6
1.1 Framing - a first approach to the potential power of the media .....	6
1.2 Objective, research question .....	7
2. Method .....	8
2.1 Methodological proceeding .....	8
2.1.1 Case selection .....	8
2.2 Qualitative research and case studies: potentials and limits .....	12
2.3 Reliability and validity .....	13
3. Christian Fuchs' theory of critical media .....	15
3.1 Notion of critique .....	15
3.2 Variables derived from Fuchs' theoretical approach .....	16
3.2.1 Ideological content vs. critical content .....	16
3.2.2 Update of the notion of proletariat .....	19
3.3 Stick to reality: Why self-management practices are not included .....	20
3.4 Negt and Kluges notion of a counter-public sphere .....	21
4. Analysis .....	22
4.1 Sample 1: Alternative newspapers .....	23
4.1.1 Case 1.1: Het Parool .....	23
4.1.2 Case 2: Die tageszeitung .....	25
4.1.3 Case 3: The guardian .....	26
4.2 Sample 2: Traditional newspapers .....	28
4.2.1 Case 4: De Telegraaf .....	28
4.2.2 Case 5: Bild .....	30
4.2.3 Case 6: The Sun .....	31
5. Conclusions .....	33
5.1 Evaluation of the findings .....	33
5.1 Critical assessment of Fuchs' approach .....	37
5.2 Further research potentials .....	38
Bibliography .....	39
Appendix .....	41
Newspaper articles .....	41
Hypotheses for alternative media and found evidence in sample 1 .....	49
Hypotheses for traditional media and found evidence in sample 2 .....	53

# Tale of Tables

Table 1: Christian Fuchs' dimensions of traditional and critical media .....	16
Table 2: Article from Het Parool- Comments on outcome of testing the hypotheses.....	49
Table 3: Article from die Tageszeitung- Comments on outcome of testing the hypotheses...	50
Table 4: Article from The Guardian- Comments on outcome of testing the hypotheses .....	51
Table 5: Article from De Telegraaf- Comments on outcome of testing the hypotheses .....	53
Table 6: Article from Bild- Comments on outcome of testing the hypotheses.....	55
Table 7: Article from The Sun- Comments on outcome of testing the hypotheses .....	56

## Table of Figures

Figure 1: Newspaper article: Case 1: Het Parool .....	41
Figure 2: Newspaper article: Case 2: Die tageszeitung .....	42
Figure 3: Newspaper article: Case 3: The guardian .....	45
Figure 4: Newspaper article: Case 4: De Telegraaf .....	46
Figure 5: Newspaper article: Case 5: Bild.....	47
Figure 6: Newspaper article: Case 6: The Sun .....	48



WESTFÄLISCHE  
WILHELMS-UNIVERSITÄT  
MÜNSTER



## Declaration on Oath

I declare on oath that I authored the following paper independently and without assistance and that I only used the resources indicated in the paper. All extracts that have been copied from publications analogously or literally are marked as such.

Name, First Name: Schröer, Miriam

Student Identification Number: University of Twente: 161 4797

Westfälische Wilhelms-Universität: 396 461

Place/ Date: Amsterdam/ December 18, 2015



Miriam Schröer

# 1. Introduction

Media's determining role in people's perception of what is important has been the object of interest of numerous researchers. The theory of agenda-setting, developed by Maxwell McCombs and Donald Shaw, expressed the idea that the media influence the formation of the public opinion in its very beginning. Walter Lippmann, who is called the intellectual father of agenda setting by Maxwell McCombs and Amy Reynolds, claimed that news media could be compared to a window to the world beyond our direct experience. It is only through this window that we create cognitive maps of that world. The consequence of this thought is that public opinion is not the reaction to the real environment, but to what Lippmann calls *pseudo-environment*. Since media-producers decide over what to present to society, it is also them who have the main power to construct this pseudo-environment.<sup>1</sup> What was needed, Lippmann argued, were independent experts who make hidden facts intelligible for decision makers.<sup>2</sup>

Decision makers are not only politicians but also those, who bring politicians into their office. Every citizen eligible to vote thus should be given the possibility to build an opinion not based on reactions to the pseudo-environment, but based on information prepared by researchers. What plays a crucial role in this professional information provision is to include the voices of members of society that are disadvantaged and normally drown out. As it is highly utopian to imagine the implementation of such a new information system into society, this thesis is devoted to a different option which might have the potential to offer a means, or might already have offered a means to a less manipulated and limited cognition of issues reported on by the media. This option is alternative media as introduced by Christian Fuchs. Fuchs started developing a theory on alternative media as he considered it highly under-researched.<sup>3</sup>

## 1.1 Framing - a first approach to the potential power of the media

With no doubt helpful before introducing Christian Fuchs' approach to alternative media is the media theory of framing. It claims that news frames suggest how audiences interpret the content of news reported by media. By doing so, news frames can have significant effects on beliefs, attitudes and even on behaviours of citizens on an issue or event.

---

<sup>1</sup> Cf. McCombs, Maxwell; Reynolds, Amy: How the news shapes out civic agenda. In: Bryant, Jennings; Oliver, Mary-Beth (eds): Media Effects. Advances in Theory and Research. Routledge, Taylor & Francis group. New York, London 2009. P.2. (In the following: McCombs; Reynolds: Civic agenda.)

<sup>2</sup> Cf. Lippmann, Walter: Public opinion. Transaction Publishers. New Brunswick, London 1998. P. xvi.

<sup>3</sup> Cf. Fuchs, Christian: Foundations of critical media and information studies. Routledge, Taylor & Francis group. New York, London 2011. P. 295. Fuchs refers to the results of a search in the "Social Sciences Citation Index" accessed on October 31, 2010 where he found 38 papers containing the words 'alternative media' in their titles. He compares this outcome with a number of 2020 results when searching for the words 'public relations'. Unfortunately, this search cannot be repeated by the author as the access to the Social Citation Index nowadays is open to a limited group of users only.

What can be understood under these frames has been concretised by Gamson and Modigliani, who described so called “packages”, comprising arguments, information, symbols, metaphors and images. In their eyes, it was such packages exerting influence on how the audience members understand, interpret, and react to a problem or issue. These packages hold one idea which stands central and is leading through the story reported by the media. This idea is the core and starting point of the production of meaning. Such packages are also characterized by which information they provide on an issue, whether they comprise details about the people affected by a problem, its costs or its implications.<sup>4</sup> The notion of such news frames offer a good background when approaching Fuchs’ theory, as he follows its basic ideas.

## 1.2 Objective, research question

Starting at the distinction between alternative and traditional media made by Christian Fuchs, the aim of this work is to test to what extend Fuchs’ theoretical classification is apt to classify media in the real world to then come to further conclusions about the potential of alternative media with regard to contributing to progress towards a situation in which media offer a news coverage that conveys a more complete picture of the issue by including the perspective of the disadvantaged which is oftentimes neglected in traditional media.

The main research question

“By which means and to what extend do alternative and traditional media provide different perspectives on the situation of refugees coming to Europe?”

will provide a general guiding frame for the conducted research. It is formulated in a rather open manner on purpose to leave room for interpretation. A sub-question is further formulated, referring back to Lippmann: “To what extend can the provision of a critical perspective by alternative media as claimed by Fuchs contribute to a more independent and complete news coverage as demanded by Lippmann?”

Fuchs considers alternative media to be critical by questioning domination whereas he thinks traditional media are not critical, even supporting existing domination patterns. Both his classification and his assumption that only alternative media can provide critical content will be questioned.

The scientific interest lies in testing Fuchs’ theory, which partly gives the impression to resort to extreme views. The work is furthermore of societal interest because it bears the potential of great awareness obtaining. It is intended to raise attention for the important role of aware

---

<sup>4</sup> Cf. Scheufele, Dietram A.; Tewksbury, David: News Framing Theory and Research. In: Bryant, Jennings; Oliver, Mary-Beth (eds.): Media Effects. Advances in Theory and Research. Routledge, Taylor & Francis group. New York, London 2009. P.2.

media use. The current crisis resulting from huge flows of refugees coming to Europe will be picked as content of the articles that will be analysed. By picking articles dealing with the same topic, it is aimed for making a strong contrast between the different perspectives presented by the media on this issue as it is expected that the differences that can be perceived between the samples are enormous. It is intended to let the disclosure of such differences lead to a better reflection on one's own knowledge and opinion of the refugee subject.

## 2. Method

### 2.1 Methodological proceeding

The research can be split methodologically into three steps. First, variables will be generated based on the characteristics Fuchs mentions for alternative media on the one hand and traditional media on the other hand. These variables that are supposed to indicate the belonging to the alternative or traditional group are then transformed into hypotheses that could be put forward by Fuchs. These hypotheses will be tested in a third step by analysing the chosen cases. The tables attached in the appendix should give an impression of how the author proceeded. If a hypothesis is proven right, this would speak in favour of Fuchs' claims. While the alternative sample is expected to show evidence of the criteria for alternative media set by Fuchs, the traditional sample is respectively considered not to. Therefore, both the hypotheses indicating alternative character and the hypotheses indicating traditional character will be tested on both samples. This is done in order to be potentially able to offer counter-proof, refuting Fuchs' assumptions. Yet the testing of the alternative sample will focus on the hypotheses derived from Fuchs' criteria for alternative media and respectively for traditional media. The testing of the alternative hypotheses that are not expected to hold true with the traditional media (and the other way around) will only be mentioned when a mentionable discovery has been made.

#### 2.1.1 Case selection

The chosen samples include three cases each which will be analysed in a cross-sectional manner. These six cases can be divided into two groups which form the samples, reflecting the expected outcomes. The first group is expected to show alternative characteristics as claimed by Fuchs. The newspaper chosen as cases therefore are the German newspaper *die tageszeitung*, the Dutch Newspaper *Het Parool* and the British newspaper *the guardian*. The second group consists of media that are expected to be traditional in Fuchs' understanding of the word. The chosen newspapers are the German newspaper *BILD*, the Dutch newspaper *De Telegraaf* and the British newspaper *The Sun*.

As the choice of cases is of immense relevance, reasons shall be given for why these newspapers have been chosen. The first criteria applied for the choice was that only daily appearing newspapers should be considered, as it is assumed that content density for example



might vary between daily and for example monthly appearing newspapers. Apart from that, only national press should be considered to guarantee a maximum of unanimity with regard to structural factors.

What might be noticed as problematic is the choice of *Het Parool*, as it puts a special focus on the city and community of Amsterdam and therewith cannot unrestrictedly be seen as a national newspaper as the other cases. It has however been come to the conclusion that *Het Parool* was a necessary choice, in the first place with regard to one last criteria that has been applied when choosing the cases. It is eventually the most central criteria. This central criteria is the expectation that the picked newspapers are actually what Fuchs would consider alternative (sample 1) or traditional (sampe 2). Which characteristics of a newspaper were searched for in order to assume that Fuchs would have considered it as alternative or traditional? As it will be pointed out in the following chapter, Fuchs' notion of critical theory has a key function in the access to his theory. This notion is very much influenced by Marxist theory, focussing on the necessity to identify processes of oppression, exploitation and domination. What is important to stress is that Fuchs includes a highly ideological parameter in his notion of critical theory by taking as a given fact the judgement that a society that is characterised to a high degree by solidarity with dominated classes is desirable. He further points out that the struggle for the abolishment of domination was something good and important. This notion of critical theory is Fuchs' basis foundation for classifying alternative and traditional media. Alternative media are critical in terms of dealing with what Fuchs considers as characteristics of the perspective represented by critical theory: Firstly, dealing with processes or conditions of suppression within society and secondly explicitly demonstrating solidarity with the oppressed class.<sup>5</sup> This can be considered a leftist orientation. There is no such thing as the one and only definition of what "leftist" means. In the article "What does leftist mean today"<sup>6</sup> by Harald Martenstein published in the German newspaper ZEIT, different notions of what leftist means are discussed. Amongst others, a green Parliamentarian is quoted, saying that leftist means to be against hierarchies and to try to advance basis democratic processes of decision-making.<sup>7</sup>

The Federal Centre for Political Education (German: Bundeszentrale für politische Bildung) summarizes: "The central leftist concern is solidarity with the weaker ones."<sup>8</sup>

---

<sup>5</sup> Cf. Fuchs, Christian: Foundations of Critical Media and Information Studies. Routledge. New York, London 2011. pp. 11ff. (In the following: Fuchs: Foundations.)

<sup>6</sup> Martenstein, Harald: „Was heißt heute links?“. URL: [www.zeit.de/2006/19/Links\\_19](http://www.zeit.de/2006/19/Links_19). Last accessed on December 18<sup>th</sup>, 2015.

<sup>7</sup> Cf. *ibid*.

<sup>8</sup> Original: „Das zentrale linke Anliegen ist Solidarität mit den Schwächeren.“ See Bundeszentrale für politische Bildung. URL: [www.bpb.de/nachschlagen/lexika/pocket-politik/16547/rechts-links-schema](http://www.bpb.de/nachschlagen/lexika/pocket-politik/16547/rechts-links-schema). Last accessed on December 18<sup>th</sup>, 2015.

Martenstein observed a change in the goals of leftists. For a long time, being leftist meant being Marxist. Supporters wanted it all at a time, the abolishment of capitalism, the redefinition of structures of ownership and production. Nowadays in contrast, Martenstein claims, leftists are less certain about how an ideal society looks like. They are rather concentrating on single steps to improve particular issues instead of calling for a revolution.

Fuchs' notion of leftist must be located somewhere in between of what Martenstein describes as "typically early" and "typically modern" views. Despite calling himself a supporter of Marxism, Fuchs is not demanding for an overall revolution but sees the potential of making progresses in small steps, which will become clearer in the next chapter. He is for example stating that the ultimate version of alternative media would include both alternative thus critical content *and* alternative production processes. Nevertheless, being aware of the problems that arise when trying to compete on the market while applying alternative production processes, Fuchs emphasises that it might even be an advantage to focus on the content while making use of existing distribution and organization patterns for example.<sup>9</sup>

In consequence, when searching for a newspaper that Fuchs would consider alternative, it has been searched for newspapers that consider themselves or could otherwise be proven to be leftist. The same is applicable for the category of traditional media. As Fuchs classifies traditional media as propagating rather right-wing and conservative content, which will be shown in the next chapter, it has been searched for newspapers that feature indications of such content.

When first thinking about a selection of newspapers, *de Volkskrant* seemed suitable, but this decision has been reflected and rejected eventually to replace it by *Het Parool*, as *de Volkskrant* cannot be considered a newspaper with a leftist orientation after all. When André Krause interviewed *de Volkskrant* chef editor Philippe Remarque in June 2015, he found out that *de Volkskrant* has indeed been rather leftist-oriented in the 1970s but has moved towards the centre since the 1990s. Remarque even said that it was their intention to approach themes with an open mind without any leftist or rightist evaluation. Readers should not be pushed into a certain direction but instead be encouraged to think for themselves. They want to present issues from several perspectives. Remarque also uses the word critical to describe *de Volkskrant*.<sup>10</sup>

So in fact, *de Volkskrant* could have served as an interesting object of research when dealing with a media model as imagined by Lippmann. But as for the alternative sample, newspapers with a leftist orientation must be chosen, *Het Parool* seemed to be the best alternative. It is important to mention that *Het Parool* is a relevant newspaper among leftist circles in the

---

<sup>9</sup> Fuchs, Christian: Alternative Media as Critical Media. In: European Journal of Social Theory. 13 (2), pp. 173-192 (2010). pp. 180f. (In the following: Fuchs: Alternative Media.)

<sup>10</sup> Cf. Remarque, Philippe (2015). Personal interview conducted by André Krause. Amsterdam, 9. Juni 2015.

Netherlands.<sup>11</sup> Furthermore a number of publications label *Het Parool* as leftist.<sup>12</sup> *De Groene Amsterdammer* might have been another alternative but has been rejected as it is a weekly appearing magazine and therewith does not show enough structural similarities with the other cases of the sample.<sup>13</sup> The other choices have been quite obvious after some considerations on options. In case of doubt, the decision-making has been oriented on the goal to choose for newspapers that reach a relatively equal number of circulation.

Still, some examples will be given on how it has been proceeded in order to find newspapers adequate for the undertaking. When typing “*die tageszeitung*” into Google, one is lead to a list of results. The official website of *die tageszeitung* presents the short message „The biggest leftist news-portal of the „tageszeitung“ from Berlin: Independent thanks to 14.000 comrades.”<sup>14</sup>

With regard to the choice of *De Telegraaf*, the results presented by pollster Maurice de Hond in his publication “Uitslag TK2012 naar printed media” have been consulted. These show amongst others that *De Telegraaf* is mostly read by supporters of the Dutch party PVV. 24% of the people voting for PVV read *De Telegraaf* at least twice a week. No other of the examined newspapers have such a big share of readers voting for the PVV. Since the PVV can be considered a nationalist populist party, it can be assumed that supporters of the PVV also prefer reading newspapers reflecting their opinion. There is no other newspaper that is read more by PVV-supporters than *De Telegraaf*.<sup>15</sup> Reasoning that the voting behaviour shares certain characteristics with the preferred newspaper suggests itself.

With regard to the other selected newspapers, the case selection has been discussed with and approved by André Krause. He functions as an expert as he has not only been doing

---

<sup>11</sup> This is an expert opinion of André Krause. He conducted a dissertation project titled „Right populism as reflected by Dutch press” (original title: “Rechtspopulismus im Spiegel der niederländischen Presse”) between 2001 and 2012 and thus can be considered an expert in assessing which newspapers have a leftist and which have traditional orientation in Fuchs’ sense.

<sup>12</sup> Cf. for example Fishman, Joel S.: The Anneke Beekman Affair and the Dutch News Media. In: Jewish Social Studies Vol. 40, No. 1 (Winter, 1978), pp. 3-24. P. 7.

<sup>13</sup> On the website of *De Groene Amsterdammer*, the following statement can be found: “De Groene Amsterdammer is a broad-minded weekly magazine for readers who are involved in society that rather want to be challenged instead of being reassured. De Groene stands for journalism that not only dares to present an opposition against the consolidated power, but also against the dominant media culture.” (original: “De Groene Amsterdammer is een vrijzinnig weekblad voor maatschappelijk betrokken lezers die eerder uitgedaagd dan bevestigd willen worden. De Groene staat voor journalistiek die niet alleen oppositie durft te voeren tegen de gevestigde macht, maar ook tegen de dominante mediacultuur.”) See De Groene Amsterdammer. URL: [www.groene.nl/pagina/historie](http://www.groene.nl/pagina/historie). Last accessed on December 12th, 2015.

<sup>14</sup> Original: „Das große linke Nachrichten-Portal der "tageszeitung" aus Berlin: Unabhängig dank mehr als 14.000 GenossInnen.“ See query „die tageszeitung“ in Google search engine. URL: [www.google.de](http://www.google.de). Last accessed on December 12th, 2015.

<sup>15</sup> Cf. De Hond, Maurice: Uitslag TK2012 naar printed media. 26th September 2012.

research on Dutch press during his dissertation, but he also lecturer for the seminars “Media and media systems” and “Media politics” at the Centre for Dutch studies in Münster.<sup>16</sup>

From each newspaper, one article will be analysed. Each of the chosen articles deals with the current situation of refugees coming to Europe. It has been intended to resort to newspaper editions from the same day. October 17<sup>th</sup> has been chosen as date to get access to all of the newspaper editions. This has been done with the underlying expectation that the different newspapers might react to current events. Unfortunately, this was not the case. In the edition of *the guardian*, not even *any* article could have been found that explicitly dealt with an issue that touched the refugee crisis. This is why a different edition of *the guardian* (from October 28<sup>th</sup>, 2015) had to be consulted. In this edition, a suitable article could be found. The fact that editions from different days have been selected does not lead to any problems as the initial reason why only editions from one day should be accessed, the expectation to find parallels in reactions to current events, did not hold true. As there were no content parallels anyway, this initial reason could not serve as a reason any longer.

The variables of interest are the characteristics of traditional and those of alternative media derived from Fuchs’ theory. The applied technique is to observe whether a certain hypothesis which will be formulated on the basis of the characteristics described by Fuchs can be verified or not. To be more specific, it will not only be a question of either yes or no, but instead it is intended to say to what extend it can be said that the variable is manifested in the data.

## 2.2 Qualitative research and case studies: potentials and limits

The conducted research applies a qualitative technique, which is advantageous with regard to several aspects. Firstly, it can be claimed that qualitative research designs are more theory-efficient. The work is guided by theory and helps to develop an existing theory or to make up a new one. Still when approaching the subject of interest, qualitative researchers do not leave their view be too much limited by the existing theory. It is instead intended to let the material speak for itself. Secondly, qualitative research designs deal right from the beginning with the definition of the cases to be examined. Most of the time, for choosing these objects of analysis, no standardized method is applied. Instead, cases are selected consciously by applying specific criteria. Thirdly, for the data collection and evaluation, interpretative techniques are used.<sup>17</sup>

All these characteristics of qualitative research seem to be highly suitable for the intended work. The limitation to a small number of cases in qualitative examinations is not due to a

---

<sup>16</sup> Cf. Westfälische Wilhelms- Universität Münster. Haus der Niederlande. URL: [www.uni-muenster.de/HausDerNiederlande/zentrum/team/andrekrause.html](http://www.uni-muenster.de/HausDerNiederlande/zentrum/team/andrekrause.html). Lastly accessed on December 18<sup>th</sup>, 2015.

<sup>17</sup> Cf.. Blatter, Joachim K.; Janning, Frank; Wagemann, Claudius (Etd.): Qualitative Politikanalyse. Eine Einführung in Forschungsansätze und Methoden. VS Verlag für Politikwissenschaften. Wiesbaden 2007. P. 24. (In the following: Blatter; Janning; Wagemann: Qualitative Politikanalyse.)

scientific ideal idea, but it is the consequence of the fact that the qualitative researcher normally examines his object of research very intensively, because he wants to avoid the simplification and reduction of a solely statistical analysis. Therefore, it is mainly due to the limited availability of time and other resources that qualitative researcher only occupy with few cases. With a corresponding accoutrement with resources and staff, nothing speaks against an enlargement of the field of examination.<sup>18</sup>

Qualitative studies are not about confirmation or rejection of a certain explanation or description by analysing the covariation between cases but about detailed analysis of the congruence of the different elements of the theoretical framework with the empirical case.

This is why qualitative research demands a high degree of theoretical knowledge and a sovereign use of this knowledge when comparing theory and empiricism. This makes the working effort much bigger which then again, as mentioned, is a reason to limit the number of cases.<sup>19</sup>

In order to answer the research question, several case studies will be conducted. The methodological use of a case study became popular among quantitatively inclined political scientists, who usually were not using this method. Despite this, applying the case study as a method is oftentimes not regarded an efficient means in statistical terms. It is called an ambiguous research design, "(...) [surviving] in a curious methodological limbo."<sup>20</sup> John Gerring defines a case study as "an in-depth study of a single unit (a relatively bounded phenomenon) where the scholar's aim is to elucidate features of a larger class of similar phenomena."<sup>21</sup>

A quantitative approach certainly would have been possible, too. Though it must be taken into consideration that as far as it is intended to provide results that satisfy a minimum of validity and reliability and at the same time maintain the research goals, a quantitative study would demand for a research design that is based on a broader time frame.

Gerring claims that researchers have to make a choice: Either they chose for a design that enables them to find out more about less or they chose for a design where they will know less about more.<sup>22</sup> Qualitative researchers interpret. That implies that the research depends on the researcher as human subject as an instrument.<sup>23</sup>

### 2.3 Reliability and validity

Reliability of measurement techniques is reached if the measurement can be repeated and will lead to the same outcomes in quantitative approaches. In qualitative research, the reliability as quality criteria is considered to a limited extend. The conscious renouncement of

---

<sup>18</sup> Cf. *ibid.* P. 25f.

<sup>19</sup> Cf. *ibid.* P. 35.

<sup>20</sup> See Gerring, John: What is a case study and what is it good for? In: *American Political Science Review* Vol. 98, No. 2, May 2004. P. 341.

<sup>21</sup> See *ibid.* P. 341.

<sup>22</sup> Cf. *ibid.* P.348.

<sup>23</sup> Cf. Bruhn Jensen, Klaus (ed.): *A Handbook of Media and Communication Research. Qualitative and Quantitative Methodologies.* Routledge. London, New York, 2002. P. 236.

standardized measurement procedures already gave an idea of that. The link to the context of the research is accepted. Though, also the qualitative researcher depends on maintaining reliability in a sense of intersubjective confirmability and traceability. Reliability in qualitative research is very close to the criteria of objectivity then, which will be mentioned later on.

Internal validity of a quantitative study is generally understood as the certainty about the relationship between the independent and the dependent variable in so far as the dependent variable is the consequence of the independent variable and not for example a result of an intervening variable that has not been considered. The influence of such additional independent or intervening variables must be controllable. Normally, for a test of validity one would construct a control group in which the independent variable would be manipulated on purpose with the expectation to get a corresponding variance for the dependent variable. Or the influence of potential intervening variables is tested. As the driven research does not examine a causal inference, this does not play a role in this thesis. Internal validity does not yet ensure that the found relationship is also externally valid, meaning that it stays true under real-life conditions.

External validity is largely accepted in qualitative research. Often it's even thought that external validity is a special quality of qualitative methods as it is very close to the field of research. It is claimed that valid information on research objects can only be won in the natural living environment of the examined object. This ensures the exclusion of artificial experiment arrangements which alienates the object of interest.

Despite this, one important aspect to mention with regard to external validity is that the outcomes of this work are valid only for the examined articles. No generalization can be made, for several reasons. It is not correct to generalize from the alternative/ traditional nature of an article to the alternative/ traditional nature of the newspaper per se. To do that, one would need to analyse a higher number of articles of the newspaper. The research conducted in the frame of this work can only make statements about tendencies of the actually examined articles. One might claim a generalizability to articles of the same author. Then again, one must consider that other influences than the opinion of the author play a role in the ideological orientation of the article, for example the expectations and orders of a superior boss. The direction and intensity of such an intervening variable can hardly be measured as it is expected not to follow patterns that can easily be decoded.

The criteria of objectivity claims that good research is characterised by intersubjective reliability and the possibility of verification. Different researchers should achieve the same results, given that all other conditions are equal, as using the same methods of analysis. Many qualitative studies describe and reconstruct in detail each step of interpretation. It is considered very important to focus on transparency and traceability to ensure that other researchers can

follow the research.<sup>24</sup> Therefore, in this work, special emphasis is put on giving reasons for interpretations.

### 3. Christian Fuchs' theory of critical media

Christian Fuchs is chair professor for media and communication studies at the Uppsala University's Department of Informatics and Media Studies in Sweden. Besides media and society, his research fields include social and critical theory. He is the author of numerous academic publications, mostly on information and media studies and on critical theory, including *Internet and Society* (Routledge 2008).<sup>25</sup>

In his book *Foundations of Critical Media and Information Studies*, Christian Fuchs establishes a definition of alternative media. He also mentions which differences with regard to traditional media can be perceived. Moreover, Fuchs makes a claim about alternative media, saying that alternative media have the potential to function as critical media.<sup>26</sup>

Alternative media, in Fuchs' view, are opponents to monopolies in public opinion. Such monopolies can for example be controlled by certain parties. Sometimes, the domination of hegemonic world-views is enough to provide such a monopoly in public opinion.

Fuchs explains that alternative media play two different roles: On the one hand, they legitimate the existing dominative system by being oppositional, which allows dominant groups to argue that the current political system is the best one possible, because it is pluralistic.

On the other hand, alternative media have the potential to spread a germ to advance a development towards a participatory democracy and a cooperative society.<sup>27</sup>

After giving a short overview over Fuchs' notion of critique, several criteria Fuchs uses to define alternative and traditional media will be mentioned and transferred into short hypotheses. Reasons will be given why certain criteria will be excluded from the research. Finally, Negt and Kluge's notion of the counter-public sphere will be introduced and linked to Fuchs' work.

#### 3.1 Notion of critique

Christian Fuchs thinks the term critique is used in an inflationary fashion in academia.

Unfortunately, the extend of this thesis does not give enough space to discuss different approaches of critique. Instead, Christian Fuchs' notion of critique will be considered as a given. Yet, a critical assessment will be provided in the conclusion, questioning Fuchs' claims on criticism/ critical theory. What is remarkable about his notion of critique is that he comprises

---

<sup>24</sup> Cf. Blatter; Janning; Wagemann: *Qualitative Politikanalyse*. pp. 36f.

<sup>25</sup> Cf. Fuchs, Christian: *Foundations of Critical Media and Information Studies*. Routledge. New York, London 2011. P. i. (In the following: Fuchs: *Foundations*.)

<sup>26</sup> Fuchs, Christian: *Alternative Media as Critical Media*. In: *European Journal of Social Theory*. 13 (2), pp. 173-192 (2010). P. 173. (In the following: Fuchs: *Alternative Media*.)

<sup>27</sup> Cf. *ibid.* P. 189.

an ideological view. Critical theory analyses how society is related to processes of oppression, exploitation and domination. The ideological view Fuchs stresses is to judge on a normative level that solidarity with the dominated as well as the abolishment of domination is something good and important. Fuchs applies this notion of critical theory to media studies.<sup>28</sup> What is of fundamental importance is to stress that for Fuchs, being critical does not equal with criticising dominant approaches. Because that would have as a consequence that if progressive social sciences were dominant, one would be expected to support conservative and reactionary approaches for the sake of pluralism. It must be emphasised forcefully that this is not what Fuchs intends. On the contrary, Fuchs does not want politically conservative approaches and instrumental academia to be supported at all but to be pushed back. The goal, after Fuchs, was not liberal pluralism. What was needed, was a critical character of academia. Such a critical character of academia would ask for an academic system that is oriented on societal problems and the advancement of participatory democracy.<sup>29</sup>

### 3.2 Variables derived from Fuchs' theoretical approach

In Table 1, Fuchs presents a comparative overview of dimensions of alternative media and of capitalist mass media<sup>30</sup>.

**Table 1.** Potential dimensions of traditional and critical media

Dimension	Capitalist mass media	Alternative media
Journalistic Production	Elite journalism	Citizens' journalism
Media Product Structures	Ideological form and content	Critical Form and content
Organizational media Structures	Hierarchical media organizations	Grassroots media organizations
Distribution structures	Marketing and public relations	Alternative distribution
Reception practices	Manipulative reception	Critical reception

*Table 1: Christian Fuchs' dimensions of traditional and critical media*

#### 3.2.1 Ideological content vs. critical content

The most relevant dimension for Fuchs, and the only relevant dimension of table 1 for this thesis is "Ideological form and content" on the side of capitalist mass media and "critical form and content" on the side of alternative media. The other dimensions of table 1 are not considered, which will be explained later on. However relevant, also the form-related criteria will be excluded from this work for the simple reason that it demands highly detailed analyses. As the content is considered the more relevant aspect among the two, the focus of this thesis

<sup>28</sup> Cf. Fuchs: Foundations. pp. 12ff.

<sup>29</sup> Cf. *ibid.* P. 17.

<sup>30</sup> Fuchs employs the terms „capitalist mass media“ and „traditional media“ as synonyms. This use of terms will be taken over.



will be reduced to the same. In the following, content -related criteria both for alternative and traditional media will be pointed out and put into hypotheses.

Capitalist mass media, Fuchs argues, offer ideological content. By ideological, Fuchs means that the content is strictly defined by what is considered popular and sellable. Fuchs names strategies such media employ in order to make content popular and sellable. As he points out that journalists of traditional media often resort to emotionalism and sensationalism, one can come to the conclusion that something is popular and sellable if it can be reported on resorting to much emotionalism and sensationalism. The criteria "sellable" obviously follows the intention to maximise profits. This focus these media keep on profit can result in a lack of quality, complexity and sophistication. Yellow journalism seems to express the superlative of this assumption by simplifying reality and focussing on singular examples.<sup>31</sup> Two hypotheses have been formulated according to this characterization of traditional media. As the purpose of this work is to find out to what extent the selected newspapers provide traditional or alternative perspectives in terms of Fuchs' classification, and as the samples have been selected in a way that the first sample is expected to show alternative characteristics and the second is expected to show traditional characteristics, the hypotheses are formulated by setting the characteristics in a sentence which can be proven wrong or right. The hypotheses can be considered a methodological tool to test the theory by reflecting the characteristics which have been mentioned before.

The first hypothesis for testing traditional media is supposed to capture all criteria Fuchs refers to as "ideological content":

1) "The content of the article is strictly defined by what is considered popular and sellable, for example by resorting to emotionalism and sensationalism. The article condones a lack of quality, complexity and sophistication by focussing on singular examples."<sup>32</sup>

All the characteristics included in the hypothesis are variables that have the purpose to make the article appear popular and thereby sellable. The second hypothesis is:

2) "In the article, structures of domination are not questioned but fostered."

In contrast, Fuchs characterises critical media by critical content. The content expresses oppositional standpoints that question all forms of domination and heteronomy. The oppositional perspectives provide alternatives to repressive perspectives that reflect the rule of capital, patriarchy, racism, sexism and nationalism. Moreover, the content pays attention to the realization of suppressed possibilities of society. Alternative media do not accept existing social structures as they are, they are interested in what society could become. The underlying goal

---

<sup>31</sup> Cf. Fuchs: *Alternative Media*. P. 179.

<sup>32</sup> Usually one would formulate one hypothesis in a single sentence expressing the expectation. As several aspects are all related to the general criteria of "ideological content", two sentences have been formulated, which should not impair the function of the hypothesis further.

is always to strengthen co-operation and participation in society. The assessment that co-operation and participation are more essential, true and desirable than competition and exclusion must be emphasised as a basic conviction. It can be considered as a part of the leftist ideological orientation Fuchs comprises in his notion of critique. Critical media further aim to advance social struggles that transform society towards the realization of co-operative potentials. Moreover, another characteristic is the materialistic expression of the interest of the dominated. Critical media content is materialistic: it addresses phenomena and problems in terms of resource distribution and social struggles. Based on unequal divisions of basic resources in contemporary society, critical media take the standpoint of the oppressed or exploited classes.<sup>33</sup>

Another quality of alternative media is the dialectical realism at the content level. Alternative media content is both dialectical and realistic. Fuchs' notion of alternative media is based on the realistic assumption that there is a world outside of cognition that can be perceived, analysed, published, criticized and changed. The resulting task for critical media is to uncover and reveal the essence behind the existence that is ideologically distorted. The term dialectic describes that there are contradictory aspects inherent within a phenomenon.<sup>34</sup> What is meant by this accordingly is that alternative media analyse social phenomena not based on one-dimensional logic, not based on the assumption that phenomena have linear causes and effects, but instead they operate under the assumption that phenomena are contradictory, open, dynamic and carry certain development potentials in them. They are based on the insight that there are not only opportunities or only risks inherent in social phenomena, but also contradictory tendencies that pose both positive and negative potentials at the same time that are realized or suppressed by human social practice. Dialectic analysis thus means complex dynamic thinking. It is intended to transcend the filtering and censorship of information by corporate information monopolies or cultural monopolies in public information and communication.<sup>35</sup>

The following five hypotheses are formulated:

- 1) "The article provides alternatives to dominant repressive perspectives that reflect the rule of capital and/ or the rule of patriarchy and/or of racism and/or of sexism and/or of nationalism"
- 2) In the article, the voices of the oppressed, dominated, enslaved, estranged and exploited are represented."

Sub-hypothesis: "Based on unequal division of resources, the article expresses the interests of the dominated."

---

<sup>33</sup> Cf. Fuchs: Alternative Media. pp. 179 ff.

<sup>34</sup> Duden. URL: [www.duden.de/suchen/dudenonline/Dialektik](http://www.duden.de/suchen/dudenonline/Dialektik). Lastly accessed on December 18<sup>th</sup>, 2015.

<sup>35</sup> Cf. Fuchs: Foundations. pp. 21.

A short explanation will be added to make the relation of the Hypothesis no. 2 and the Sub-hypothesis clear. The hypothesis no. 2 is of very vague nature. It is supposed to capture all kinds of oppressed people. The sub-hypothesis is explicitly setting the focus on the unequal division of resources. Whenever the content of interest would deal with the unequal division of resources, the author would be expected to explicitly emphasize the position of those who suffer from it. This is already inherent in hypothesis no. 2 and theoretically could have been ignored. Yet in this work a particular focus is laid on reflecting the theory in the hypotheses as precisely as possible. With the hypotheses, it is thus intended to mirror the aspects Fuchs mentions.

3) “The ideal of a participatory democracy and of a co-operative society is manifested in the article.”

Sub-hypotheses:

3.1) “The article proposes possibilities of change with regard to obtaining the ideal situation.”

3.2) “The article deconstructs ideals saying things can’t be changed.”

3.3) “In the article, social struggles are advanced.”

Hypothesis 3) is the generally formulated expectation. Hypotheses 3.1) to 3.3) propose different ways how hypothesis 3) can be proven right. Hypothesis 3.1) refers for example to any means which advance a cooperative and participatory society which are not explicitly social struggles (because that would fall under hypothesis 3.3). One could for example think of a change of law or other structural factors. The sub-hypothesis 3.2) has a passive approach. It is not stated that pro- cooperative or pro- participatory movements are advanced actively, but instead such claims, which present (social) structures as if there were not changeable, are put into question.

4) “The article presents phenomena including contradictory, open and dynamic aspects and mentions possible development potentials they carry in them.”

This last hypothesis captures the variable of dialectical realism.

### 3.2.2 Update of the notion of proletariat

Fuchs introduces the class of the proletariat as the group of people who have a disadvantaged, exploited, repressed position in society. The notion of the proletariat is commonly associated with industrial wage labour. The nature of the proletariat has changed since the 1970s, due to the rise of the service and the knowledge labour as well as due to rise of neoliberal individualism. The globalisation of production and the rise of new social movements weakened this labour class towards capital. Because of these changes, Fuchs claims, the notion of the proletariat needs to be updated. It will thus be expanded and include unemployed, house workers, migrant workers, developing countries, retirees, students, precarious workers, precarious self-employment and knowledge workers.

One can still use the notion of the proletariat to describe the unity of the diversity of conditions and experiences of exploitation. But it should no longer be limited to the notion of the industrial wage labour class. Critical media are media of a multitude, of an updated proletarian counter-public sphere<sup>36,37</sup>

### 3.3 Stick to reality: Why self-management practices are not included

It would be an ideal case within contemporary society if all of the alternative practices and structures listed in Table 1 were given. Besides critical content (and form), Fuchs further demands of critical media to implement practices of citizen journalism, meaning that everybody should potentially have the possibility to participate in media production. Moreover, he thinks that grass root organizations would be best suited to realize the concept of alternative media. Plus, alternative media should be distributed with the help of alternative means. Alternative publications should be sold in alternative bookshops and should not finance themselves through advertisements, for example. Finally, besides the critical production he also stresses the role of critical reception.

However, it would demand for a different societal framework, which allows all citizens to have the time, the skills and the resources so that they can act as critical journalists and critical recipients at the same time. It requires the establishment of a participatory democracy and of a cooperative society. But as long as these structural conditions are not met, alternative media production structures face limited possibilities and fix constraints.

Besides the lack of these structures in society, another problem must be taken into consideration: These self-managed practices can also be used to advance highly repressive, e.g. fascist content. This dimension is not alternative in a leftist sense. This is why Fuchs focusses more on content and the form of media products and less on the process. This is by no means to argue that process is unimportant, but that a minimum requirement for speaking of an alternative medium is critical content or critical form. Also mainstream media can be considered alternative media, under certain conditions. Though it is desirable that as many other alternative qualities are achieved as possible. In the framework at hand, citizen journalism, self-managed ownership, alternative distribution and critical reception are desirable qualities of alternative media but not necessary conditions.<sup>38</sup>

Non-commercialism, small-scale grass root structures and the use of alternative distribution forms are an advantage in situations where media aims at mobilizing local communities.

But professionalized structures that aim at high circulation rates and at reaching masses are more suitable in situations where media aim at large-scale societal transformation and the transformation of the consciousness of manipulated and simple-minded people.

---

<sup>36</sup> The notion of the counter-public sphere will further be defined in chapter 3.4.

<sup>37</sup> Cf. Fuchs: *Alternative Media*. pp. 185f.

<sup>38</sup> Cf. *ibid.* pp. 180f.

Both strategies can be combined, there is no binary distinction between two columns presented in Table 1. So only in the area of content it is a necessarily precondition to be on the alternative side but they can also make use of mainstream strategies and structures. Particularly in order to reach larger audiences, alternative media should not see themselves entirely opposed to commercial strategies and professionalized marketing.

By using these mechanisms, progressive content can be produced and distributed.

Herbert Marcuse already pointed out that counter-institutions make use of existing structures in order to transcend these structures and overcome the problem of weak diffusion and inferior quality. Working against established institutions while working in them brings the possibility of learning how to use the mass media. Counter-institutions have long been the aim of movement, but their lack of funds was greatly responsible for their weakness and inferior quality. What is central is to make these counter-institutions competitive. They must be apt to counteract establishment education, instead of only filling a vacuum. This notion of counter-institutions stresses the institutional context of critical media.<sup>39</sup>

### 3.4 Negt and Kluge's notion of a counter-public sphere

Oskar Negt and Alexander Kluge identify a proletarian public sphere that has the critical function to contribute intellectual means to class struggles. They think that this proletarian public sphere reflects the degree of emancipation of the working class. It is a sphere of autonomous communication of the proletariat. Self-organisation manifests itself here as well as the unfolding of the interest of the workers. It forms a kind of society within society which functions as self-defence organization of the working class. This sphere generalizes and unifies the collective experience of the proletariat, especially its experiences in production and its context of living. They engage in the production of counter-products which offer alternatives to offered products: "Idea against idea, product against product, production sector against production sector."<sup>40</sup>

Next, the relation between critical media and the counter public sphere shall be pointed out. Alternative media have the potential to stimulate public debates. Because they are embedded in society, they must be analysed together with their societal context<sup>41</sup>

The book „Public Sphere and Experience: Analysis of the Bourgeois and Proletarian Public Sphere."<sup>42</sup> by Negt and Kluge resulted in a general discussion and a discussion within the alternative media discourse. A superficial reading can create the impression that their account is not very different from subjective notions of alternative media- both approaches have a strong focus on production processes of media. But for subjective notions of alternative

---

<sup>39</sup> Cf. *ibid.* P. 183.

<sup>40</sup> Cf. *ibid.* P. 176.

<sup>41</sup> Cf. *ibid.* P. 183.

<sup>42</sup> Original title: „Öffentlichkeit und Erfahrung. Zur Organisationsanalyse von bürgerlicher und proletarischer Öffentlichkeit.“ Suhrkamp. Frankfurt am Main, 1972.

media, the focus is on any type of media production that takes place outside the established mass media, grassroots do it yourself production processes are at the heart of alternative media, with a focus on the degree of democracy of production. For Negt and Kluge, such processes are only part of counter-public spheres if they are an expression of the interests of the dominated. They are interested in left-wing media, the control of intellectual means of production and actual production of counter-ideas by the political left. They do not exclude participatory production, but they understand self-organisation not primarily as *prosumption* but as constitution of critical organizations that are autonomous from capitalist ideologies. For some approaches also right-wing media content is a kind of alternative medium, but Negt and Kluge exclude all media and media content from their notion of proletarian public spheres if they are not part of the political left.

Negts and Kluge's notion of counter-public sphere applied to media is close to the ideal type model of critical media outlined in Table 1. Both focus on left-wing content and the control of production structures by the political left. The difference between Fuchs' model and the one from Negt and Kluge is that Fuchs' approach is based on a more systematic notion of communication that distinguishes between actor-level and structural level of social systems. Negt and Kluge have a relatively unordered way of theorizing that lacks general foundations.

Fuchs considers critical media as communicative dimension of the counter-public sphere.

Another connection between alternative media and the public sphere is that alternative media is frequently connected to protest movements that make use of these media for information, communication, coordination and cooperation processes. This aspect is included in the hypothesis 3.3) for alternative media: "In the article, social struggles are advanced."<sup>43</sup>

## 4. Analysis

What is important to point up before discussing the outcomes of the empirical analysis, is the role refugees play in this thesis. In this context, Fuchs' update of the notion of the proletariat must be reconsidered. As mentioned in chapter 3.2.2 "Update of the notion of the proletariat", Fuchs stressed the relevance of including a larger variety of groups to the suppressed class, amongst others immigrant workers and developing countries. It is assumed that Fuchs would include refugees from the Middle East coming to European countries to this updated proletariat. Especially Fuchs' mentioning of developing countries as part of the suppressed class gives enough indication that this conclusion would certainly be in Fuchs' spirit. For an integral understanding of the analysis it is recommended to read the articles attached in the appendix. In the following, the derived hypotheses for alternative media will be tested analysing *sample 1*, comprising three newspapers that are considered to be alternative. After that, the derived

---

<sup>43</sup> Cf. Fuchs: Alternative Media. pp. 184f.

hypotheses for traditional media will be tested analysing *sample 2*, comprising three newspapers that are considered to be traditional. Regarding the methodological requirement to test whether the hypotheses for alternative media can be falsified in sample 2 as well as to test whether the hypotheses for traditional media can be falsified in sample 1, it will be paid particular attention to this. Yet this will not be tested step by step for reasons of time resource.

## 4.1 Sample 1: Alternative newspapers

### 4.1.1 Case 1.1: Het Parool

The first article to be analysed is titled “A fence against the big bad world outside”<sup>44</sup>. It was published in the Dutch newspaper *Het Parool* on October 17, 2015 and deals with the increase of countries that think about constructing walls or fences to protect their territories from entering refugees. The first hypothesis states that alternatives to dominant repressive perspectives that reflect the rule of capital, of patriarchy, of racism, of sexism and of nationalism must be expressed in order to qualify as alternative newspaper. Already the title suggests an offensive critique: “A fence against the big bad world outside” – “the big bad world outside” is obviously meant in an ironic sense. It can be considered as social class which is tried to keep outside of one’s own wealthy hemisphere. The refugees who are coming from the “big bad world outside” are the subject of a counter-movement. The traditional mainstream perspective is the one of a group among western nation states who want to isolate themselves from them, the ones who want to build a wall in order to be able to keep on suppressing those who belong to the updated proletariat. This “big bad world outside” and the people fleeing from it to save Europe is questioning or above all threatening dominative structures. But as the article makes clear that the title is not to be taken seriously, it does not take the standpoint of those constructing fences. However, it can neither be said yet whether or not it takes the standpoint of the suppressed, thus the refugees. Accordingly, it can be concluded that the article does suggest an alternative to the rule of nationalism by making fun of nation-states building fences and walls to protect their nation-state from others.

Yet there could be found one aspect that speaks against this: the article states that it is important to protect the nation-state.<sup>45</sup> This can by no means be considered a provision of alternatives to the rule of nationalism but rather a nationalist view which would be a characteristic of traditional instead of alternative media.

The next hypothesis is “The article represents the voices of the oppressed, dominated, enslaved, estranged and exploited.” This hypothesis can be approved as the author of the article puts emphasis on the fact that the construction of fences is very dangerous for the refugees

---

<sup>44</sup> Original title: „Een hek tegen de grote boze buitenwereld”. Cf. Chaudron, Janne: Een hek tegen de grote boze buitenwereld. In: *Het Parool*, October 17, 2015. pp. 16f.

<sup>45</sup> Original: “De natiestaat moet worden beschermt.”, see *ibid*.

who still try to climb it. Yet this can of course not be compared to articles which deal exclusively with the situation of refugees, which is why it must be come to the conclusion that the second hypothesis can only be validated to a limited extend. The point is mentioned, but only incidentally. Though one must be aware of the fact that if the main focus was put on the perspective of those governments deciding to build such walls, the aspect that it worsens the conditions for refugees would not even be mentioned.

The sub- hypothesis concerning the materialistic expression of the interest of the dominated cannot be confirmed. The aspect was not mentioned.

The hypothesis: "The ideal of a participatory democracy and of a co-operative society is manifested in the article." with the sub-hypotheses 3.1) "The article proposes possibilities of change with regard to obtaining the ideal situation", 3.2) "The article deconstructs ideals saying things can't be changed." And 3.3) "In the article, social struggles are advanced." cannot be confirmed. The article does not deal with this ideal or with possible ways and strategies how to get closer to its realization. Angela Merkel is cited, claiming that East-Europeans should know that isolation does not work. In a short introduction text to the article it is already anticipated that these walls do not really "help". That is stressed again by including another citation of American politics philosopher Wendy Brown in the article. He says that the walls have a very big ideal metaphorical meaning in the first place. The following citation emphasizes this position: "It's a big illusion to think that you can protect the people against the bad world in this manner. The possession of weapons of the Americans for example means a bigger threat to security than the flow of refugees.". By including all these different citations, the author provides counter-information to the basic idea that a wall protects and offers arguments which speak against this idea. Yet they are not really suggesting cooperation with the refugees but just state that the walls actually have different purposes or at least they are built with different motivations than to offer protection. Instead of suggesting concrete measures to deal with refugees in a cooperative manner, a remarkably pragmatic view is elaborated: It is stressed that all European countries are in need of cheap labour as a consequence of globalisation processes in the economy. Hungary for example is in need of migrant workers because many educated Hungarians move away. This pragmatic perspective on the issue has nothing to do with the ideal of a cooperative and participatory democracy. There is no appeal to work together instead of against each other. It is not the social struggle of refugees which is intended to support. Instead, a rather objective, so value-free point of view is promoted. At the same time, this aspect can be a proof for the hypothesis about dialectical realism. Stressing this aspect confirms Fuchs' hypothesis that alternative media deal with the sometimes contradictory and dynamic nature of issues instead of simplifying issues by mentioning only linear causes and effects. In particular Fuchs' demand for taking into consideration certain development potentials can be observed. The future lack of labour



forces in many European countries is a development potential of the discussion around refugee acceptance or refusal. It is also a highly realistic way of approaching the situation.

#### 4.1.2 Case 2: Die tageszeitung

From the German newspaper *die tageszeitung* from October 17/18 2015, the article “Mohammed Deaa wants to study”<sup>46</sup> was chosen. With regard to the first hypothesis, it could be observed that some parts of it could be proven right. The article claims that administration stands in the way of the education of refugees. This is a statement reflecting repressive structures. One can take it as a proof for the (part-) hypothesis “The content provides alternatives to dominant repressive perspectives that reflect the rule of nationalism” as the administration makes a big difference between residents of the corresponding country and those who are not.<sup>47</sup> When saying “The university explains itself”,<sup>48</sup> the author of the article makes his standpoint clear. If there was no harm in this discrimination, no justification would be necessary. Justification is asked for in situations in which something has been done wrong. So the author thinks justification is necessary, showing that he would demand equal or at least better conditions for refugees at German universities. Bureaucracy is presented as an authority that is setting limits to the possibilities of universities to facilitate the access of refugees to universities. The article takes up a stance against this hindering bureaucracy apparatus which performs acts of domination.

Moreover, the article claims that the will was there on the part of the universities but that bureaucracy ties their hands. It is pointed out that refugees are neither allowed to study nor to work, which is without doubt a critique of the rule of nationalism. One might even see the (part-) hypothesis “The content provides alternatives to dominant repressive perspectives that reflect the rule of racism.” confirmed.

The second hypothesis, demanding for the representation of the voices of the oppressed, dominated, enslaved, estranged, exploited can be proven right: The article starts out of the perspective of Mohammed Deaa, a young refugee searching for admission at the Humboldt-Universität in Berlin. Not only are his actions, thoughts and hopes reflected, partly by citing him, but also is he in all of the pictures.<sup>49</sup> Also the sub- hypothesis on materialistic interests

---

<sup>46</sup> Original: “Mohammed Deaa will studieren“, cf. Pauli, Ralf. Mohammed Deaa will studieren. In: Die tageszeitung, October 17/18, 2015. pp. 29 ff. (In the following: Pauli: Mohammed)

<sup>47</sup> Of course one might argue that discriminating against refugees at universities is no action that should be called “nationalism”. But it is assumed that Fuchs has a very narrow perception of where “nationalism” starts. This is why any discrimination based on nationality is considered “nationalism” here.

<sup>48</sup> Original: “Die Hochschule rechtfertigt sich.”, cf. Pauli: Mohammed. P. 30.

<sup>49</sup> The fact that the refugee is in the pictures would rather be attributed to the form-related criteria developed by Fuchs. The fact that Mohammed Daa is depicted alone in the photos, for example alone in a classroom, obviously holds intentions that were followed by taking the photos the way they were taking. This implicit critique can also be perceived in another picture where Mohammed is standing alone in front of the university entrance. It has been photographed from backwards, inviting the observer to imagine how his future might develop. These instruments transport implicit intentions. Cf. article in the appendix.

can be verified in this article. The “model for everyone” is a model which is connected to little costs so that everyone can effort to make use of it. Of course, refugees coming to a new country are oftentimes deprived from what they possessed or they were not possessing much in their home country in the first place. The article mentions that refugees are given for example second hand notebooks to counterbalance the inequalities in distribution of resources. It is also addressed how the refugee is supposed to pay for things to get into university if he is not allowed to work. Accordingly, it can be stated that this hypothesis was confirmed.

Also the ideal of a participatory democracy and of a co-operative society can be perceived in the article. For example in the expression “A model for everyone” when introducing a model of ensuring the education level of refugees who have lost their documents, that might be an option for more universities to adapt. A model that does not exclude anyone is a model that supports a development towards a participatory, cooperative society. Possibilities of change are proposed with regard to obtaining the ideal situation by mentioning that three different centres will be opened where aptitude tests will be offered as well as language courses. 4,7 million euro will be spent on these centres until 2018. This support towards more equality of chances for refugees is a possibility of change towards a participatory, cooperative society. Also the sub-hypothesis “Ideals saying things can’t be changed are deconstructed.” can be perceived in a citation, even if in a quite subtle way: “It can be done differently”<sup>50</sup>, is a wording Fuchs would have appreciated. Of course this is not only about this one sentence but about the content behind it. Still, this formulation seems to be a key expression to verify the hypothesis. When Steffan Baron is quoted who says “It would be necessary to provide examinations for each single semester of study.”<sup>51</sup>, it sounds as if it was too much effort to do and thus unrealistic. But the article offers examples where it succeeded and thereby deconstructing ideals saying that things cannot be changed. Social struggles are not advanced explicitly. Moreover, the article can be considered dialectical as it takes into consideration different points of view, dangers and necessities. Of course, students need to provide evidence that they have followed corresponding education in their country of origin. It is not claimed to ignore this necessity. But it would also be highly discriminating to deny the right of going to university of a refugee just because he or she lost his documents in civil war. This balancing of different causes and effects of the situation is very important and leads to a more complete picture of the issue.

#### 4.1.3 Case 3: The guardian

The last case study of the first sample is the article “Pegida has crept into every family, every workplace, every sports club. It’s a poison” from the British newspaper *the guardian* from

---

<sup>50</sup> Original: “Es geht auch anders.”, cf. Pauli: Mohammed. P. 31.

<sup>51</sup> Original: “Man müsste für jedes Fachsemester eine eigene Prüfung erstellen.”, cf. Pauli: Mohammed. P. 30.

October 28, 2015. The first hypothesis can partly be proven right as the author positions himself as opposed to the German Pegida- movement. Doing so already offers a perspective that reflects the rule of racism and nationalism. Also the phrase in the title "It's a poison" clearly suggests a negative attitude towards Pegida. The article starts with reporting on a man going to the opera with his wife as they pass protestors from Pegida. He says that his daughter wanted to attend this demonstration as well and asked her parents to babysit but he refused saying he was going to the opera and would not support such activities. This is already an expression of an opposition. The opera they were going to had banners hanging at front of it saying: 'Open your eyes', 'Open your hearts' and 'The dignity of humans is sacrosanct', quoting article 1 of the German constitution. Next to that, a large screen was showing the messages: 'We're not a backdrop for intolerance' and 'We're not a stage set for xenophobia'. The article starts by presenting the opposition against Pegida.

When testing for the second hypothesis, there could not be found much to validate it. There is no explicit representation of the voices of the oppressed who would be the object of Pegida's anger: immigrants and refugees coming to Germany.

Testing the hypothesis of the presence of the ideal of a participatory democracy and of a co-operative society in the article, one finds especially the sub-hypothesis about the advancing of social struggles confirmed. The online campaign '#IchBinDresden' (English: I am Dresden) had the goal to make those speak up who have not joined Pegida. This attempt to mobilize people to express an alternative to Pegida can without doubt be seen as a counter-movement. This initiative only had little effect. Silvio Lang, spokesman of the association Nazi Free Dresden is quoted saying that they do not know how to oppose Pegida. Even if the counter-movement is at a loss, the article still reports on it. Furthermore, possibilities of change towards an ideal situation are introduced by claiming that "the government needed to give people the feeling they are in control again, that those who should protect them are doing so, that might take the wind out of the sails of the protest."<sup>52</sup>

With regard to the hypothesis on dialectical realism derived from Fuchs' theory, one can say that the article offers a much differentiated view on Pegida. The author makes an effort trying to explain why a movement like Pegida could emerge and of what their worries consist. They are called "the embittered centre"<sup>53</sup> who are in search of the feeling of belonging. The article suggests that it might have something to do with the collapse of communism and the related loss of sense of belonging. Another reason is given: as most people in this region are low-wage workers, do not belong to a church and are not represented by a trade union, they feel menaced. Afraid that no one represents their interests if they do not do it themselves, they

---

<sup>52</sup> See Connolly, Kate: Pegida has crept into every family, every workplace, every sports club. It's a poison. In: The guardian, October 28, 2015. p. 18.

<sup>53</sup> See *ibid.*

develop this intense anger. Especially a relativisation by citing Timo Lochocki, analyst of European Populism and fellow at the German Marshall Fund thinktank, offers evidence to confirm hypothesis no. 4. He claims that it is important to include Germany's history into the evaluation of the situation and debate. The radical change Germany has been going through in the past 20 years contributes to the prevailing sentiments. The change to a very European, open and multicultural attitude took place too fast for some. Also the rejection of its migration policy of decades and its replacement through a new, much more liberal one, has made many insecure. Lochocki stresses that this transformation necessarily has an immense psychological impact, so the reaction and the emerging of such movements would be understandable. He estimates the next six months as crucial to judge over future developments which can be considered a confirmation of the demand for mentioning possible development potentials phenomena carry in them as part of hypothesis no. 4.

## 4.2 Sample 2: Traditional newspapers

### 4.2.1 Case 4: De Telegraaf

The case study from the Dutch newspaper *De Telegraaf* edition of October 17, 2015 is an article called "Average man is almost sick of admission of asylum seekers"<sup>54</sup>.

When testing the hypothesis claiming that traditional media content was strictly defined by what is considered as popular and sellable, for example by making use of emotionalism and sensationalism or by presenting complex issues too superficially so that no differentiated view can be established, one must come to the conclusion that it cannot be approved. The article goes beyond emotions and sensations and it cannot be claimed that the considerations made in this article simplify reality or suffer from a lack of sophistication.

What is interesting with regard to the hypothesis "Traditional media are not questioning but fostering structures of domination", is that these protestors against refugee acceptance that the article deals with actually must be considered a kind of counter-movement. But in Christian Fuchs' theory, they would be considered the mainstream as they support nationalism and racism. What can be considered problematic when attaching this anti-refugee movement to the traditional 'camp' is that what they criticise is the lack of local democracy. They are complaining about the authorities only informing the people, who have been bereft of all political influence. They have the impression that The Hague takes decisions, without including them in the process of decision-making. This is why they do not feel their interests being represented by the authority. Of course, that must be considered a serious critique of democracy. But it is not a leftist critique and thus no counter-movement in the Fuchs' sense. It might also be assumed that the people are not angry because they are not heard but more because of the consequences it had this time. There would probably be less of a complaint if people

---

<sup>54</sup> Original: "Gewone man is haast met asielopvang zat", cf. Bakker, Alexander: Gewone man is haast met asielopvang zat. In: *De Telegraaf*, October 17, 2015. p. T4.

were not connected as closely to the consequences of political decisions. But this certainly is only an assumption. The problematic around the representation of the people is further discussed. It is mentioned that in Utrecht, surveys are made to find out about people's opinions. Frank van Liempdt from the party Lokaal Liberaal has the opinion that if most of the people have no problems with refugees, then the party should not hold on to a different attitude. It is criticized that these surveys were not very well done, as they could be filled in several times for example. A better alternative is proposed with a referendum. Mentioning these viewpoints does not confirm Fuchs' assumptions on traditional media. Firstly, quoting a politician who says that he is not willing to represent an opinion that the people he is supposed to represent are not sharing cannot be considered an indication for tendencies towards supporting heteronomy in news coverage. Second, the fact that they mention a way of improving surveys which are conducted in order to find out what the will of the people is cannot be called a means of supporting structures of domination, but instead rather a means which advances ideals of participation.

It is further discussed why people are "tired" or "sick" of refugees. A sociologist is quoted explaining that the fact that the gap between good and bad earning people has widened is why people that are less educated are more concerned with housing and social welfare benefits. So in the end it can be considered a question of competition: they experience it in a more direct fashion, more immediately on the job market, or when searching for a social rented flat. In contrast, people with a better education do not notice refugees much, they often even barely get in touch with them. As most of the politicians are well educated as well, the question is raised whether representatives of the people shouldn't mirror the people more. This is quite a dialectic perspective on the issue. At least it cannot be confirmed that the author of the article simplifies the issue on purpose to turn it more popular and sellable.

What is particularly noticeable when looking at the page on which the article is printed is the one right below titled "But I would like to get a new mattress."<sup>55</sup> Even though not explicitly part of the case, a quick evaluation shall be given, taking into consideration that it makes the impression to belong to the article just analysed. The two articles show a strong contrast on how people deal with refugees. The claim in the just examined article is that they perceive them as threat because they are competitors. In the article right beneath is reporting on Letty Berg, who is very empathic with refugees. She reports on how hard the transition from the refugee centre to a proper home must be. When refugees arrive at a centre where they are granted shelter for the first time, they meet people from their countries being in the same situation. Once they get a flat, which is of course actually a nice change, they are all on their own. Letty Berg describes a situation she has observed: A man from Eritrea was good at

---

<sup>55</sup> Original: „Wel graag een nieuw matras”, cf. Roosendaal, Marie-Thérèse: Wel graag een nieuw matras. In: De Telegraaf, October 17, 2015. P. T4.

learning Dutch but suddenly, when he moved out of the centre, he lost his Dutch skills and felt very tired all the time. She is helping refugees with signing rental contracts or when demanding for social benefits. She stresses that they can always call her. So in this article, people are not angry about the arrival of refugees but ready to help them. This is a provision of an alternative to the rule of nationalism and racism. Obviously, one of the hypotheses derived from Christian Fuchs' claims on alternative media can be confirmed in this article which was expected not to show evidence for alternative media.

Yet, when the young Eritrean man meets a woman and invites her to his place, Letty Berg attaches importance to his behaviour: he should not invite her for dinner but only for a tea and a biscuit, because this is how Dutch people do. So one might find a little bit of nationalism in this behaviour of passing on cultural habits and values eventually, but to such a small extend that it should not further play a role.

#### 4.2.2 Case 5: Bild

"All hat and no cattle?"<sup>56</sup> is the title of the analysed article from the German yellow press newspaper *Bild*. Horst Seehofer was claiming that refugees who had no chance of being granted asylum should consequently be deported quicker. The article is questioning how serious Seehofer really is with this claim. Several reasons are named that speak against his honesty. For example, it is stated that against Seehofer's claim that Germany as a state was responsible for questions of refugees, it is in fact the German Federal Lands which are in charge of such questions. As Seehofer said he could not do much against the crisis from the "Landtag", as decisions were taken in Berlin, the article damasks his seemingly contradictory statements. It is furthermore mentioned that Bavaria did not deport many refugees, "only" 2900 this year. The author of the article further accuses refugees of making up excuses (being sick, not being able to travel) in order to stay in Germany. They would sue Germany in order to gain time while a protracted examination of the case takes place at the court. Seehofer promised to improve the bureaucratic processes with the intention to deport refugees quicker. The author says Seehofer had to "admit" that institutions needed modernization, showing once again that the main intention pursued in this article is to make clear that refugees who have no legal asylum right should be deported quicker. By the end of the article, it is stated that voters who would usually vote Christian-social union (CSU) are more and more tempted to switch over to the right populist party Alternative for Germany (AfD).

With regard to the first hypothesis, it could thus be observed that the author of the article did not hesitate to resort to emotionalism. That becomes clear for example in the sentence "Horst Seehofer must be aware of that!"<sup>57</sup> when talking about the strategies refugees use to extend

---

<sup>56</sup> Original: „Grosse Klappe, nix dahinter?“, cf. Unknown author: Grosse Klappe, nix dahinter? In: *Bild*, October 17, 2015. P. 2.

<sup>57</sup> Original: „Das weiß eigentlich auch Horst Seehofer!“, cf. *ibid.*

their stay in Germany. This is a manner of expression that is very accusing and that sounds very angry. The way the article deals with the fact that Seehofer makes statements but does not act accordingly is can also confirm the hypothesis that traditional media make use of sensationalism. It is presented as disturbing, alarming, unsettling news.

Obviously, the article also simplifies the issue by not mentioning which reasons could be given to justify refugees in Germany trying to find excuses to stay longer. Neither is the bureaucratic system, which makes examinations last very long, defended. One might for example claim that it is important to test each case in detail instead of running the risk of misjudging a case because it has been dealt with too superficially.

So the claim the author of this article wants to make is without doubt: Seehofer only pretends to be an advocate of a containment of the number of refugees being granted the right to stay a little longer. In fact, there are a number of actions of his that are contradictory to this opinion. The way it is presented, it is provoked that readers feel betrayed by the lack of liability Seehofer is showing. They even name the article “Check”, so what they are doing in this article is testing to what extend Seehofers anti-refugee-acceptance- attitude can be taken seriously. The result of the “check” is that Seehofer cannot be trusted, which brings about deception and anger, thus emotions are provoked by the article.

Approaching the second hypothesis again makes one confront an ambiguity: The hypothesis states: “In the article, structures of domination are not questioned but rather fostered.”. On first sight it might seem as if criticising a politician equals with criticising domination structures. But Christian Fuchs puts emphasis on the aspect that domination or the dominating class is characterised by suppressing the (updated) proletariat.

As the lack of suppression exercised by Seehofer is criticised by the author in this article, one cannot say that by accusing Seehofer on not being strict enough with refugees and on talking about being decided to take measures so that refugees are deported quicker, domination was questioned. Domination would be questioned if the question was ‘Why is not done more to help refugees?’. This is why the second hypothesis can be confirmed as well.

#### 4.2.3 Case 6: The Sun

Lastly, the article „MERKEL ‘Mummy’ to ‘People Smuggler’” out of the British newspaper *The Sun* will be analysed.

When testing on the first hypothesis of Fuchs’, claiming that traditional media offer ideological content defined by what is considered popular and sellable, and thus frequently employing emotionalism and sensationalism as well as not attempting to show the complexity of issues but reducing it to certain aspects by focussing on singular examples, several passages can be found to draw the conclusion that this hypothesis is true.

First of all, Angela Merkel is called “hero”, “mommy”, “smuggler” and “traitor”, which are obviously highly emotionalized words. The contrast made in the article, the change of mood in

society, the picture Germans had from Merkel turning from a “hero” and “mommy” to a “traitor” and “smuggler” even intensifies this impression.<sup>58</sup> The second headline “Germans turn against leader over immigration” can verify the hypothesis as well. It is very one-sided as evidently, it is not Germans in general turning against Merkel. But it is more of a sensation when put like that. It is not sophisticated at all, but much exaggerated and put in a radical form. The focus on singular examples, in this case Germans turning against Merkel, becomes clear as no Germans are mentioned who support Merkel’s policy, who think that it is a good and necessary approach. This is an indication of a lack of dialectical presentation, of simplifying reality.

At the side of the article, numbers are given that are supposed to support the changed attitude of ‘the Germans’. As it is better to put numbers in relation to comparison magnitudes, this is another indicator showing that the article is not sophisticated.

Frauke Petry of right-wing Alternative for Germany party is quoted saying: “Merkel has invited the victims of civil war from all over the world. This is completely irresponsible.” Christian Fuchs would consider exactly this behaviour of Merkel responsible. Especially when one takes into consideration that Germany’s involvement in civil wars in the Middle East pushed civil war movements to a considerable extend, then this can only be considered responsible. But as Petry’s opinion is put forward in particular, the author of the article positions himself rather on the nationalist side. There is no criticism on right-wing movements and no warning about the danger such movements bring with them. Noticeable is also a little article next to the examined article, reporting on a baby of refugees that was injured in an attack by Neonazis. This gives the impression that migration in general is a bad thing, people should rather die while staying in their home-country. But when a baby was killed, that causes an uproar and that is called inhuman. This is a very obvious proof of resorting to emotionalism.

When attempting to test the second hypothesis, one arrives at a delicate question which has already been touched in the analysis of the *Bild* article. The hypothesis claims that traditional media would rather foster instead of question existing domination patterns. In fact, what is described in the article would be called “questioning domination”, as it is about “the Germans” turning against Merkel, who represents without doubt an instance of domination, a central authority figure. But it must be questioned whether this group turning against an open migration-policy can be considered a counter-movement. As it is highly nationalist and racist, this group must be considered the traditional mainstream whereas those supporting Merkel can be seen as the leftist counter-sphere. What becomes obvious here is that the counter-public sphere must not always be found in the opposition to leading parties and decision-makers. Analysts are quoted, warning that Germany runs the risk of tearing itself apart if Merkel’s

---

<sup>58</sup> See Parker, Nick: MERKEL ‘Mummy’ to ‘People Smuggler’. In: The Sun, October 17th, 2015. P. 12f.



soft-touch Germany, “A hippy state ruled by its feelings” persists. This is a negative labelling, trying to make Merkel look bad, naïve and emotional. Fuchs would presumably appreciate this labelling as it goes hand in hand with his ideal of a cooperative society which of course is built upon an attitude which again results from a feeling of empathy. Cooperation is built upon empathy and participation is built upon a feeling about what is just.

## 5. Conclusions

### 5.1 Evaluation of the findings

Referring back to the research question “By which means and to what extent do alternative and traditional media provide different perspectives on the situation of refugees coming to Europe?” a differentiated answer will be given.

The article analysed from *Het Parool* could for the most part be qualified as an alternative media in Fuchs’ understanding. Even though it did not take side for refugees explicitly, the author still did position himself against those political leaders who decide to construct a wall or fence on their borders to keep refugees out. It pays special attention to a pragmatic, realistic-dialectic inspection of the issue by stressing the potential future importance of refugees on the labour market. Yet besides the explicit positioning in favour of the refugees, the article also lacks a materialistic component as well as the emphasis on the ideal of a cooperative and participatory society by for example supporting social struggles. The article could have mentioned initiatives that try to stop the construction of such walls and fences. Yet, after all, it can be considered rather alternative.

The article chosen from *die tageszeitung* was showing evidence confirming all hypotheses derived from Fuchs’ theory and therewith can be called alternative without reproach. Only the part of the hypothesis suggesting that the rule of sexism and of patriarchy should be reflected has not been validated. But as this is no condition but only one aspect among others that can lead to the qualification as “alternative”, this should not further play a big role.

The examined article from *the gurdian* also provided data which proved the formulated hypotheses right. Amongst others, mentioning a counter-movement lead to this conclusion. This group of opponents must be considered part of the counter-public sphere as defined by Negt and Kluge. Moreover, as in *Het Parool*, much emphasis was put on the provision of background information, explanations and expert opinions. Though what was missing in comparison to the article from *die tageszeitung* was the explicit taking sides for the oppressed. But of course one has to keep in mind that it might be asked too much to find all of the criteria in only one article, as one article must reduce its content to certain aspects as well and cannot include all aspects the author would like to include.

Comparing these three articles, the one found in *die tageszeitung* is the best example of alternative media after Fuchs' definition. *The guardian* only lacks a confirmation for hypothesis no. 2, whereas *Het Parool* is only really proving hypothesis one (partly) and four. The outcome of the analysis of the alternative sample showed that articles focused more on a pragmatic presentation of the issue than on the representation of the powerless and suppressed. This finding does rather not support the idea of the potential mobilising role alternative media can play.

Among the sample of traditional newspapers, a bigger deviation from the expected outcome could be manifested. The article taken from *de Telegraaf* bore the biggest surprise. Not only was the group of people who protest against refugee acceptance presented in a relatively objective manner, also did the author of the article include suggestions on better possibilities of citizen participation in the political decision-making process. By doing so, it is in fact even suggested a way to abolish the emergence of such frustrated and insecure racist citizen-movements. Moreover, the presentation of how other people deal with the situation of having refugees living next door is a suggestion of alternatives to repressive structures shown in the 'main' article. It is furthermore explained why groups of citizens feel threatened by the arrival of refugees. As a consequence, one must come to the conclusion that this article holds evidence of a number of criteria of alternative media.

The article taken from *Bild*, in contrast, provides data to confirm Fuchs' assumptions on traditional media. The article reduced content to a very one-sided, one-dimensional point of view. There was no counter-voice included, neither was the presentation of the issues sophisticated or complete. Instead, it fostered suppressive patterns.

The article taken from *The Sun* must be located on the same level as *Bild*. It was resorted to emotionalism and sensationalism to a large extend. Furthermore, no counter-movement has been mentioned, instead, reality was simplified by stating that "all Germans" had turned against "traitor" Angela Merkel. The author of the article positions himself rather on the side of "the Germans" by including simple numbers to support the point of view. The small article on a refugee baby being attacked by neo-Nazis is one last indication which confirms the hypotheses for traditional media: When cooperation is granted for babies but not for adults in need, then this must be nothing more than a little emotional, thus popular, thus sellable story.

What can be concluded is that the articles did not verify the hypotheses as expected as the hypotheses could only be verified to a limited extend. Most problematic is the discovery that the article derived from *De Telegraaf* did show indications that are, in Fuchs' opinion, indices for alternative media. In the methodological chapter it was said that both the occurrence of Fuchs' criteria and the claim that only alternative media could provide critical content should

be tested. This case can be considered a proof for the fact that Fuchs' claim about the relation between alternative media and critical content must be rejected. Also traditional media, for example *De Telegraaf* as shown here, can provide a critical perspective by dealing with content aspects that are expected to only be found in alternative media. Accordingly, Fuchs' claim that only alternative media can provide critical content must be refuted. This can be considered a main finding of the conducted analysis.

With regard to an international comparison, one can derive from the outcomes that the German cases from sample 1 and from sample 2 did meet the expectations, whereas the other countries showed deviation. The British articles did so to a limited extend, just deviating slightly from the expectations by not showing evidence of certain criteria. Thus as a tendency, the article from *the guardian* in sample 1 qualified as alternative and the article from *The Sun* in sample 2 qualifies as traditional media. The Dutch newspapers did not confirm Fuchs' theory. *Het Parool* is the newspaper showing least evidence in the alternative sample 1. Though it can still be considered alternative, as some aspects could be found. *De Telegraaf* is the second Dutch newspaper which did not meet the expectations as it comprised elements that Fuchs qualifies as criteria for alternative media.

Fuchs' ideal vision of an article that deals exclusively with the interests of the dominated has not been found among the cases. This is not problematic as the objective was to find out to what extend the classification can be retraced in the samples. Fuchs' ideal picture of alternative media would mean a devotion to critical content in his sense with no exceptions. Presumably publications such as *Pravda* and *neues deutschland* could be considered such ideal versions of alternative media. *Pravda* (English "Truth") was the official newspaper of the Communist Party of the Soviet Union and was one of the most influential papers in the country. The goal was to make workers write for workers, including their interests, points of views and struggles. This of course must be considered highly alternative in Fuchs' conception at the process level which has not been considered in this work. Though it is important to keep in mind Fuchs' limitation of defending Marxist views when it comes to historical 'errors', how he puts it.<sup>59</sup> So it can by no means be claimed that Fuchs would support media that propagate any activities that would support violent regimes or dictatorships.

Also the German daily newspaper *neues deutschland* would probably satisfy Fuchs' requirements to alternative media in a more integral fashion than the here analysed sample of newspapers. It has a political mission as well as the aim to advance a certain ideal shared by Fuchs. Though here again one must urgently be careful when it comes to repressive tendencies of extreme leftists. What must be paid the biggest possible attention to is not to leave

---

<sup>59</sup> Cf. *ibid.* P. 24.

the news coverage be led by political intentions rather than facts. As *neues deutschland* was influential in times of the German Democratic Republic, there are with no doubt a number of activities which must be condemned as wrong. *Neues deutschland* reported for instance on August 22, 1968 on the military intervention to smash the Prague Spring as an “activity to help the Czechoslovakian brother people” in response to a request from the party- and state officials from the Czechoslovak Socialist Republic. Neither these people, nor the request existed. The risk is that such media positioning themselves on the extreme left do not intend to be objective, but biased on purpose. They further serve as a means to mobilize for political activity and political organisation of the extreme left.<sup>60</sup>

It cannot be stated that Fuchs’ approach provides evidence to sympathise with such extreme leftist propaganda, though from a theoretical point of view, not very much can be found that explicitly draws a line, except when Fuchs mentions different ways of interpreting Marxism and that ‘errors’ shall not be repeated.<sup>61</sup>

It shall furthermore be referred back to what has been proposed in the introduction as a background- intention of this work and what has been addressed in the sub- research question: “To what extend can the provision of a critical perspective by alternative media as claimed by Fuchs contribute to a more independent and complete news coverage as demanded by Lippmann?”. It has been said that Fuchs’ classification is tested in terms of to what extend it is apt to classify media in the real world. The underlying intention was to find out about the potential of alternative media to contribute to a situation in which media would provide a more integral news coverage instead of giving a manipulated “look out of a (tinted) window”. Such an ideal idea of news coverage initially formulated by Lippmann demands for the inclusion of hidden facts as for example the thought derived from critical theory, that any privilege is connected to a discrimination.<sup>62</sup> The inclusion of the voices of the dominated and the attempt to convey a picture of the issue that includes contradictions and to make an effort to include all relevant perspectives in a report, all these alternative characteristics do contribute without doubt to a news coverage that approaches towards Lippmanns idea. What is problematic about alternative media is the extreme resort to Marxist ideology, because it can be assumed that Lippmann did not have such an ideological complexion in mind. Lippmann asks for objective but integral information provision by researchers whereas Fuchs asks for leftist information provision by politically inclined people. Especially the fact that Fuchs wants normal citizens to participate in media production processes whereas Lippmann wanted researchers and professionals to perform the job of information provision turned out to be more

---

<sup>60</sup> Cf. Bundeszentrale für politische Bildung: Linksextreme Medien. URL: [www.bpb.de/politik/extremismus/linksextremismus/33630/medien](http://www.bpb.de/politik/extremismus/linksextremismus/33630/medien). Last accessed on December 18th, 2015.

<sup>61</sup> Cf. Fuchs: Foundations. P. 24.

<sup>62</sup> Cf. Fuchs: Foundations. P. 25.

of a contradiction than has been assumed in the beginning. Ideology always seems to get in the way when trying to give an informative overview on an issue. To explore this dilemma, a new thesis would need to be written. To sum up, alternative media do rather not offer a contribution to an objective news coverage because they are too much ideologically disposed.

### 5.1 Critical assessment of Fuchs' approach

The conducted research has shown that Fuchs' theory is quite broad and hard to capture in detail. In one way it would have been helpful if Fuchs' characteristics set for alternative and traditional media were more precise, on the other hand this might have made things more complicated in a different manner- when criteria are too narrow, one might be confronted with problems of assigning observations to characteristics. It happens that one thinks that it fits, but because it's too much narrowed down to a concrete criteria that might not be met in this particular case it does not fit after all. Still, the general nature of the claims Fuchs makes must be mentioned as a problem when identifying alternative and traditional media.

This identified vagueness is to a large extend due to the immense influence ideology has on Fuchs' theory. Teun A. Van Dijk states that ideologies are "of a rather general and abstract nature"<sup>63</sup>. Among others, their function is to define which values are of importance to the group sharing a certain ideology.<sup>64</sup>

Yet even though the lack of tangibility must be considered an aspect that impedes the working process significantly, it also must be acknowledged that this ideology is the mind-set Fuchs considers a precondition in order to achieve societal change in the long term. Moreover, it can be assumed that the vagueness is, besides the central role ideology plays in it, due to the fact that Fuchs' notion of alternative media as critical media is only dealt with in one chapter of his book "Foundations of Critical Media and Information Studies". If he had devoted an entire book to that topic, this might have provided a more in-depth display of his idea.

Another criticism could be found with regard to Fuchs' neo-Marxist orientation. Many times one has heard that any Marxist approaches would be outdated, have no relevance for contemporary empirical research. Fuchs mentions several reasons that justify why he holds on to Marxist theory. In his view, there are different "Marxism's" that will not stop haunting capitalism, which has already been put forward by Jaques Derrida. The neo-liberal mode of development put forward by capitalism has led to the tightening up of severe poverty, a considerable rise of unequal income distribution, and has produced a worldwide economic crisis. The latter, so Fuchs suggests, brings up a reactualization of the Marxian critique of capitalism. As already mentioned, Fuchs stresses that Marxism must be separated from historical

---

<sup>63</sup> See Van Dijk, Teun A.: Ideology and discourse analysis. In: Journal of Political Ideologies (June 2006), 11(2), 115-140. P. 116.

<sup>64</sup> Cf. *ibid.*

errors that have been committed that have been related to Marxist governments. It is important to acknowledge that these errors are not immanent in Marxist theory, but represent interpretations of it.<sup>65</sup>

Lastly, especially with regard to the findings in *De Telegraaf*, it shall once again be stressed that one cannot speak of “alternative media” being critical and “traditional media” not to be. Instead, it must be filtered to what extent one can speak of critical content. The findings of this thesis have shown that the first sample rather manifested the characteristics of alternative media and the second sample has rather met the expectation formulated for traditional media, though only with restrictions and exceptions. This must lead to relativisation of the explanatory power of the theory. Even though Fuchs says that it was acceptable if alternative media resort to non-alternative processes and organizational structures, he did not declare the same free space for traditional media. He does not claim that traditional media had the tendency to sometimes resort to alternative perspectives. This is where Fuchs must be proven wrong.

## 5.2 Further research potentials

What would be of particular interest for further analyses is to make Fuchs’ criteria and the formulated hypotheses measurable in a more precise way. This could be done for example by assigning numeric values to the occurrence of single alternative and traditional attributes in an article. It would further bear the chance of unveiling national characteristics to focus more detailed on the international comparison. During the research for this work, it has been found out how each of the newspapers has a very particular profile. Each newspaper would demand to be examined several times during a longer period of time. Not only one article, but all articles of each newspaper edition would need to be included to be able to draw reliable conclusions.

Another approach would be to stick to the idea to focus on one particular discussion, but to broaden the scope of research by including a higher number of cases.

One last possible modification would be to spend more time selecting particular articles that actually deal with precisely the same issue, for example, to examine different articles that all report on Pegida. That would facilitate the comparison by making contrasts more easily observable.

---

<sup>65</sup> Cf. *ibid.*

## Bibliography

### *Literature*

**Blatter, Joachim K./ Janning, Frank/ Wagemann, Claudius (Etd.):** Qualitative Politikanalyse. Eine Einführung in Forschungsansätze und Methoden. VS Verlag für Sozialwissenschaften. Wiesbaden 2007.

**De Hond, Maurice:** Uitslag TK2012 naar printed media. 26th September 2012.

**Fishman, Joel S.:** The Anneke Beekman Affair and the Dutch News Media. In: Jewish Social Studies Vol. 40, No. 1. Winter, 1978, pp. 3-24.

**Fuchs, Christian:** Foundations of Critical Media and Information Studies. Routledge. New York, London 2011.

**Fuchs, Christian:** Alternative Media as Critical Media. In: European Journal of Social Theory 13(2): 173-192 (2010).

**Gerring, John:** What is a case study and what is it good for? In: American Political Science Review Vol. 98, No. 2, May 2004.

**Jensen, Klaus Bruhn (Edt.):** A Handbook of Media and Communication Research. Qualitative and Quantitative Methodologies.

**McCombs, Maxwell; Reynolds, Amy:** How the news shapes out civic agenda. In: Bryant, Jennings; Oliver, Mary-Beth (Editors): Media Effects. Advances in Theory and Research Routledge, Taylor & Francis group. New York, London 2009.

**Remarque, Philippe:** Personal interview conducted by André Krause. Amsterdam, 9. Juni 2015.

**Van Dijk, Teun A.:** Ideology and discourse analysis. In: Journal of Political Ideologies. June 2006, 11(2), pp. 115-140. P. 116.

### Newspapers

**Chaudron, Janne:** Een hek tegen de grote boze buitenwereld. In: Het Parool, October 17, 2015. Pp. 16f.

**Connolly, Kate:** Pegida has crept into every family, every workplace, every sports club. It's a poison. In: The guardian, October 28, 2015. P. 18.

**Parker, Nick:** MERKEL 'Mummy' to 'People Smuggler'. In: The Sun, October 17, 2015. P. 12f.

**Pauli, Ralf:** Mohammed Deaa will studieren. In: Die tageszeitung, October 17/18, 2015. Pp. 29 ff.

**Roosendaal, Marie-Thérèse:** Wel graag een nieuw matras. In: De Tele-graaf, October 17, 2015. P. T4.

**Unknown author:** Grosse Klappe, nix dahinter? In: Bild, October 17, 2015. P. 2.

Internet

**Bundeszentrale für politische Bildung:** „Rechts-links-Schema“

URL: [www.bpb.de/nachschlagen/lexika/pocket-politik/16547/rechts-links-schema](http://www.bpb.de/nachschlagen/lexika/pocket-politik/16547/rechts-links-schema)

Last accessed on December 18th, 2015.

**Bundeszentrale für politische Bildung:** „Linksextreme Medien“

URL: [www.bpb.de/politik/extremismus/linksextremismus/33630/medien](http://www.bpb.de/politik/extremismus/linksextremismus/33630/medien)

Last accessed on December 18th, 2015.

**Martenstein, Harald:** „Was heißt heute links?“

URL: [www.zeit.de/2006/19/Links\\_19](http://www.zeit.de/2006/19/Links_19)

Last accessed on December 18<sup>th</sup>, 2015.



## Newspaper articles

Figure 1: Newspaper article: Case 1: Het Parool



Figure 2: Newspaper article: Case 2: Die tageszeitung







Kurz vor Semesterbeginn und die Semesterklausuren noch fern: Ali Ghazawi muss al-Ghazawi die Deteriben fragen, ob er an ihren Kursen teilnehmen darf



## Ohne Zeugnis geflüchtet?

„Eine Wissens-  
abfrage wäre sehr  
aufwendig. Man  
müsste für jedes  
Fachsemester eine  
eigene Prüfung  
erstellen“

STEFAN NIKOL, STUDIENBEREITER,  
HUMBOLDT-UNIVERSITÄT BERLIN

plätze versprochen. Ab Januar  
sollen anerkannte Flüchtlinge  
ohne Wartzeit häufig erhalten.  
Geduldete Personen müssen  
15 Monate in Deutschland ge-  
wohnt haben, dann wären es  
nach vier Jahren. Alles Weitere  
müssen die Bundesländer be-  
stimmten – und regeln.

Vom Land zu Land sind die Zu-  
lassungshürden jedoch unter-  
schiedlich hoch. Die meisten  
bieten heute nur eine kosten-  
lose Gastfreundschaft an. Gas-  
thgeber dürfen nur wenige Ver-  
sicherungen pro Woche besuchen. Sie  
sind weiterhin studienrechtlich  
nicht anerkannt, auch dürfen sie Stud-  
ienleistungen erbringen.

In der Sprechstunde wird  
al-Ghazawi klar, dass er sein

geheimt will wissen, wie er einen  
deutschen Abschluss nachweisen  
kann. Ein afghanischer Hausge-  
lehrter erkundigt sich in mündli-  
chem Deutsch nach einem rich-  
tigen Studium. „Co-Master“, nur  
mühsam verständlich.

In den Sondergesprächen  
für Flüchtlinge haben sich  
alle Interessierten nach einem  
regulären Studium erkundigt.  
berätigt eine Pressesprecherin  
der Universität. Viele hätten be-  
reits kurze in ihrem Heimatland  
besuche, manche hatten sogar  
einen Abschluss. Die meisten  
sind mit 15 Jahren nach  
Deutschland, wo sie für einen  
regulären Studienabschluss  
ihre Unterlagen mitbringen  
müssen. Schulabschlüsse, Master-  
diplome, Deutschzertifikate.

Auch al-Ghazawi will die Un-  
iversität so bald wie möglich  
seine Deutschkenntnisse nach-  
weisen. Doch einen offiziellen  
Sprachkurs darf er erst dann be-  
legen, wenn ihn das Bundesamt  
für Migration und Flüchtlinge  
für schutzwürdig befunden hat.  
„Bei anderen Syriern hat das mit  
zwei Monaten gedauert“, sagt al-  
Ghazawi. Anfangs lernte al-Gha-  
zawi täglich in einer öffentli-  
chen Bibliothek Deutsch. Mo-  
mentan besucht er einen ehren-  
amtlichen Deutschkurs an der  
Begegnungsstätte der Berliner  
Volksolidarität in Mitte. Sein  
Cousin in Hannover hatte ihm  
einen Facebook-Link geschickt.

Wie al-Ghazawi vorschlag  
macht, sind die vielen offenen  
Fragen. Ob sein syrischer Schul-  
abschluss „als Hochschulzu-  
gangsberechtigung anerkannt  
wird, weiß er nicht. Das Origin-  
al hat er in Dax zurückgelas-  
sen. Das Foto auf seinem Smart-  
phone reicht nicht als Nach-  
weis. Er braucht das Original  
des Dokuments, selbst eine Kopie  
würde nicht genügen. Der-  
zeit überlegt die Studienleiter-  
konferenz, wie sie eine Regelung  
aus dem Jahr 1965 anpassen  
kann. Vermutlich ist ein Indirek-  
ter Nachweis der Hochschulzu-  
gangsberechtigung möglich,  
wenn Studienende die Univer-  
sität aus „politischen Gründen“  
nicht erbringen können.

Darüber wird diese Regelung  
unterschiedlich ausgelegt. Man-  
che Hochschulen begnügen  
sich mit vorläufigen Ver-  
sicherungen oder prüfen Fak-  
ten.

aus einem begrenzten  
Studium. Die Studienleiter  
empfehlen den Hochschulen  
bei der Einzelfallprüfung nicht  
zu strenge Maßstäbe anzu-  
legen. „Heute haben alle höf-  
lichen Zeugnisse in der Cloud  
gespeichert, da müsste es eine  
Möglichkeit geben“, sagt Lars  
Föhl, der bei der Universität  
Berlin daran arbeitet. Flücht-  
lingen den Nachschub zu  
erleichtern. Das müsste jedoch  
generell geregelt werden.

### Problem nicht erkannt

An der Humboldt-Univer-  
sität ist eine Einstufungsprü-  
fung für Geduldete mit Stu-  
dienverfahrung bisher nicht  
möglich. Al-Ghazawi darf seine  
Kenntnisse in Betriebswirt-  
schaft und VWL also nicht in ei-  
nem Test nachweisen. Die Hoch-  
schule rechtfertigt sich: „Eine  
Wissensabfrage wäre sehr auf-  
wendig. Man müsste für jedes  
Fachsemester eine eigene  
Prüfung erstellen“, sagt Stefan  
Nikol, Leiter der Studienbera-  
tung. Einen solchen Fall habe es an der

Hochschule noch nicht gegeben.  
Doch mit jedem Flüchtling, der  
sein Studium fortsetzen will,  
stellt sich das Problem wieder.

In allen Bundesländern  
schaut der Wille vorhanden zu  
sein, sich für Flüchtlinge zu öff-  
nen. Doch die Bundesländer sind  
eng gestrichelt. Und der Umfang  
des Problems ist noch nicht er-  
kannt. Der Berliner Senat hat  
zwar angekündigt, dass er die  
Zugangshürden für Flücht-  
linge abbauen und die Kosten  
für Gastfreundschaften und die  
Aufstockung von Studienkol-  
legien und Sprachkursen  
übernehmen will. Zudem lebt  
das Berliner Studentenwerk 10  
Stattbildungsstellen über 1.000  
Euro aus, um einmalige Kosten  
wie die Anerkennung von Stu-  
dienleistungen oder Verwal-  
tungsbeiträge zu decken. Doch  
das Universitätsamt fehlt jede  
Vorgabe der Politik, für wie viele  
Studierenden sie planen sollen.

Auch nach einer Woche hat  
Dina al-Ghazawi die verspro-  
chene E-Mail mit Studieninfor-  
mationen von der Tutorin nicht

bekommen. Bei einem Freund  
versucht es der Gastgeberin-  
trag auszufüllen. „Es ist sehr  
kompliziert“, sagt er. In Syrien  
habe er sich für das Studium  
eingeschränkt, jetzt muss  
er herausfinden, welche der stu-  
dierenden Vorlesungen und Seminare  
einen guten Überblick verschaf-  
fen. Er ist sich nicht mehr sicher,  
ob er überhaupt noch Wirtschaft  
studieren will. Als er das Formu-  
lar ausgefüllt hat, hat er sich ein  
Angebot auf Arabisch gewählt:  
einen Kurs in Integrations- und  
Migrationsforschung.

### Al-Ghazawi gibt nicht auf

Neben al-Ghazawi haben sich  
nach 15 weiteren Geflüchteten an  
der Humboldt-Universität. Für  
eine Gastfreundschaft bewor-  
ben. An der Technischen Univer-  
sität waren es 45. In werden ver-  
mutlich mehr werden. Ein Teil  
der Asylsuchenden wird dauer-  
haft in Deutschland bleiben. Für  
diese Menschen sei es bedauer-  
lich, so heißt es aus dem Senat,  
„dass möglichst frühzeitig die  
erforderlichen Schritte für eine

gelingende Integration in die  
hiesige Gesellschaft eingeleitet  
werden“. Al-Ghazawi Erfahrungen  
sagen, dass dieser Schritt  
noch Taten folgen müssen.

Al-Ghazawi muss sich im  
Wintersemester damit begnü-  
gen, auf zu Gast zu sein. Bevor  
er richtig studieren kann, muss  
sein Asylstatus bewilligt wer-  
den, er muss die nötigen Zeug-  
nisse beschaffen und einen der  
wenigen Studienplätze für Aus-  
länder bekommen. Und won-  
noll er sein Studium beenden?  
Arbeiten darf er in Deutsch-  
land erst nach 15 Monaten.  
Dann darf er wiederzuke-  
hren. Im nächsten Semester  
vollzieht in einem Jahr. Dann  
werden al-Ghazawi und viele  
andere Flüchtlinge die nötigen  
Chancen, eine Aufenthalts-  
genehmigung und die nötigen  
Sprachkenntnisse haben.

Das wissen auch die Univer-  
sitäten. Christian Thomsen, Prä-  
sident der Technischen Univer-  
sität Berlin, ruft mit einem  
so vielen Bewerbern. „Der Run  
startet kommenden Herbst.“

## Sein Zeugnis hat al-Ghazawi in Syrien gelassen. Er hat nur ein Foto davon auf dem Smartphone

Wirtschaftsstudium nicht fort-  
setzen darf. Sein Zeugnis aus  
Syrien, Sprachkenntnisse und  
eine Aufenthaltsgenehmigung  
als das kann er bis zum Semes-  
terbeginn nicht nachweisen.  
Für die kommt nur eine Gas-  
thörschaft infrage. Die Tuto-  
rin versucht, das Angebot bei  
den Flüchtlingen zu beworben.  
Wer sich für Ende Oktober ein-  
schreiben, für den ist die Gas-  
thörschaft kostenlos“, sagt sie.  
Sie lässt einen Zettel herum-  
gehen, auf dem die Anwesen-  
den ihre E-Mail-Adresse und  
den gewünschten Studiengang  
eintragen können. Die Tutorin  
verspricht gezielte Lebensbera-  
tungen und Ansprechpartner. Auf  
die Frage, ob Gaststudenten Prü-  
fungen ablegen und Leistungen  
anerkannt lassen können, für  
den Fall, dass sie später regulär  
studieren, reagiert sie zurück-  
haltend. Das hängt vom Dozen-  
ten und der entsprechenden  
Prüfungsausschüsse ab. „Für mich ist  
das besser, als nichts tun“, wird  
al-Ghazawi später sagen. Er sieht  
unglücklich dabei aus.

Nach der schlechten Nach-  
richt können die Flüchtlinge  
Fragen stellen. Ein syrischer Au-



Studien darf er nicht, arbeiten auch nicht. Al-Ghazawi in seiner Berliner Wohngegend

**Es  
geht  
auch  
anders**

44



Figure 3: Newspaper article: Case 3: The guardian

18 The Guardian | Monday 28 October 2013

# International

Angela Merkel has become a hate figure for Pegida rallies that often feature a cracked-up poster showing the German chancellor vomiting a Nazi salute

## 'Pegida has crept into every family, every workplace, every sports club. It's a poison'

**Kate Connolly** in Dresden sees a city polarised by the rise of the nightwing group fiercely opposed to Angela Merkel's immigration policy

With her hands clicking on the mobile, 35-year-old Kate Connolly looks on as a group of about 100 people, mostly men, dressed in dark, hooded clothing, march down a street in Dresden. They are carrying a large banner with a cracked-up poster of Angela Merkel, the German chancellor, vomiting a Nazi salute. The group is part of the Pegida movement, which stands for 'Patriotic Europeans Against the Islamisation of the West'.

Connolly is reporting on the rise of the nightwing group, which is fiercely opposed to Angela Merkel's immigration policy. She describes the city as polarised, with the Pegida group representing one extreme and the majority of the population representing the other.

She notes that the Pegida group is not just a fringe movement but has crept into everyday life, appearing in families, workplaces, and sports clubs. She describes it as a 'poison' that is spreading through the community.

representing a frustration before that Pegida does."

On stage in the square is Lutz Bachmann, Pegida's founder and leader, and his wife, a blonde woman, and a young girl. Bachmann is speaking to the crowd, which is holding a large banner with a cracked-up poster of Angela Merkel, the German chancellor, vomiting a Nazi salute.

Bachmann is speaking to the crowd, which is holding a large banner with a cracked-up poster of Angela Merkel, the German chancellor, vomiting a Nazi salute.

Bachmann is speaking to the crowd, which is holding a large banner with a cracked-up poster of Angela Merkel, the German chancellor, vomiting a Nazi salute.

protest, but in early November it took a few hundred disgruntled souls and was considered by most to be on its way out. Many supporters were said to have been put off by Facebook images of the march posing as Hitler's Wehrmacht. But for several weeks the movement has been given a fillip by the refugee crisis, not least by the concrete city and faces as to how it might develop.

To some extent the success of the protest is a result of the refugee crisis, not least by the concrete city and faces as to how it might develop.

To some extent the success of the protest is a result of the refugee crisis, not least by the concrete city and faces as to how it might develop.

is taking up with a chart detailing the Pegida progress, and their connections to the right groups around Europe.

"A year in, Pegida has crept into every family, every workplace, every sports club, every church, every school. The main question being asked is are you for or against it?" he says.

He defines the protesters as the "white hate" group, the movement of people who are not represented by the state, and who are not represented by the state.

He defines the protesters as the "white hate" group, the movement of people who are not represented by the state, and who are not represented by the state.

the German-Turkish and an Adolf Hitler who said what a shame it was that "concentration camps are no longer in operation". The white hate, a man turned up with a crack-up poster showing the German chancellor vomiting a Nazi salute.

The white hate, a man turned up with a crack-up poster showing the German chancellor vomiting a Nazi salute.

The white hate, a man turned up with a crack-up poster showing the German chancellor vomiting a Nazi salute.

**'Tell you it will not be long before that [hotel Prince Eugen, bought to shelter refugees] burns'**  
Lutz Bachmann, leader of Pegida

**A protester dressed as Hitler in a mock celebration of Pegida's first anniversary**



## ANALYSE Vlam in de pan tijdens bijeenkomsten over vluchtelingen

# Gewone man is haast met asielopvang zat

door Alexander Bakker

**AMSTERDAM** • Iedere avond is het raak: volkswoede over opvang van vluchtelingen. Vanak slaat de vlam in de pan bij een informatiebijeenkomst. Lokale bestuurders en politici worden slachtoffer van de woede. En zijn zoveel mensen het zat?

Orde democratie is dood, oordeelt voorzitter Fons Zinken van de Vereniging voor Plaatselijke Publieke Groeperingen. 'Zo'n grote volksverzuiving hebben we al een tijd niet meer gehad. Onze overheid boeit de bevolking op tijd te informeren, maar die landelijke politieke partijen houden zich aan landelijke voorschriften. Den Haag beslist.'

De vereniging, met een achterban van 130 politieke partijen in alle hoeken van het land, maakt zich zorgen over de haast waarmee inwoners worden overvallen met vluchtelingopvang.

'Raadsleden hebben tijd nodig om eerst met burgers te spreken voor ze een standpunt innemen. Zo hoort het te gaan bij volksvertegenwoordigers.'

## Ingepikt

Het werpt de vraag op of de lokale overheid nog wel van ons is... Zelfs de spreektijd voor burgers wordt bij extra raadsvergaderingen 'ingepekt' door politieke partijen. In Purmerend trok de GroenLinks-leden op om het aantal voorstanders kunstmatig te vergruizen en in Den Haag charde de PVV een Kamerlid. Tegelijkertijd waren er raadsleden op sociale media aan wedstrijd om het spelletje wie heeft de meeste vandeanders tijdens de inspraakzonde?

Zinken heeft er geen goed woord voor over: 'Politiek bedrijven over de rug van asielzoekers, terwijl de burger aan het woord mag. Een kwalijke zaak.'

In de Drechtstreek gemeente Stichtse Vecht gooien ze het wel over een andere heug: enquêtes. De burger aan het woord. Dat gaat maar



Met sponte en lezer protesteert een groep Leuswarders in het WTC in Leuswarden. Zo'n veertig demonstranten en tientallen belangstellenden waren gisteravond aanwezig bij een demonstratie tegen de komst van 500 asielzoekers.

FOTO: HENRIK VAN NOORDHOUT

niet... 'De vragen zijn te tendentius', vindt GroenLinks-'Onzin', roept fractievoorzitter Frank van Liempd van Lokaal Liberaal. 'In tegenstelling tot de welkomsbrigade zijn wij tegen opvang. Maar als de meerderheid er geen pro-

blemen mee heeft, wie ben ik dan een nog tegen te zijn? Ik ben een volksvertegenwoordiger.'

De lokale bus in de peis is overigens niet gelukkig met de enquête. 'Het is ons al gekukt om het formulier meerdere malen in te vullen. Een

referendum is echt serieus.'

Terug naar de overige koffie tijdens gemeentelijke informatiebijeenkomsten in theaterzalen en sportpaleizen. Hier treffen we de gewone man. Schreurs en agressievlelingen prikken een dag later op foto's in alle

kruisen. Wederom de vraag: waarom zijn zoveel mensen het zat?

Socioloog Maarten Wolbers bestudeerde de kloof tussen hoog- en laagopgeleiden. Zo leerde de professor zijn landgenoten kennen die minder lang in de studiebanken doken: de groep die nu fanatiek strijdt tegen opvang van asielzoekers en al helemaal weinig heeft met de royale ontvangst van vluchtelingen, huisen en zorgvoorzieningen.

## Concurrentie

Wolbers begrijpt ze inmiddels. 'Laagopgeleiden ervaren een veel directere concurrentie van vluchtelingen op de werkvloer of in de zoektocht naar een sociale huurwoning. Hoogopgeleiden merken er in hun omgeving weinig van, ze hebben amper met nieuwkomers te maken', legt de professor uit.

Tegelijkertijd zijn de meeste politici weer hoogopgeleiden. 'We kunnen ons afvragen of de volksvertegenwoordiging niet een beetje afgepeld is zoals moeten zijn.'

## Run Syriërs op de LOI

door Arianne Mantel

**LEIDERDORP** • De online onderwijsinstelling LOI vaart wel bij de komst van Syrische vluchtelingen in ons land. Er is grote belangstelling voor het volgen van een cursus, extra scholing of een studie.

'We merken dat het om hittezuur mensen zijn die graag willen leren. Het onderwijs steent in Syrië was voor de oorlog van een goed niveau en ze zijn wel goed opgeleid, maar zien in dat ze extra onderwijs op maat nodig hebben om aan te sluiten op de vraag van de Nederlandse maatschappij. Per aanmelding bekijken we wat ze individueel nodig hebben en graag willen. We zijn druk bezig de diploma's die ze meenemen te bekijken en een waarde eraan te geven. Voer sommige onderdelen van een studie kunnen ze vrijstelling krijgen', zegt LOI-directeur Marijn Jan Kuipers.

Probleem is dat de Syrische studenten de lessen graag in het Engels willen, dus is de instelling hard op zoek naar Engelstalige docenten voor de online begeleiding.

## DAGBOEK NIEUWE BUREN

door Martin Thérèse Rosendahl



## 'Wel graag een nieuw matras'

Dorpen en steden in ons land hebben te maken met de toestroom van asielzoekers. Met busladingen tegelijk komen deze 'nieuwe bureu'. Zo ook in De Bilt. Onze verslaggeefster volgt de ontwikkelingen. Deel 15.

**L**etty Berk zit er mee: 'Een Eritrese jongen kreeg vandaag de sleutel van zijn appartementje. Om negen uur was hij al in Maarsseveld, met de bus uit het aze in Utrecht. Koffertje mee. Eerst was er die blijdschap om zijn eigen huisje. Maar toen hij de deur achter zich dichtrok, ging het ineens slecht met hem. Dat zie ik wel vaker: in de opvang zijn er altijd veel mensen en landgenoten. Nu word hij teruggevoerd op zichzelf. Alleen op de wereld in Maarsseveld. Ineens was hij ook al het Nederlands kwijt. Doodzonde in zijn hoofd.'

De 19-jarige jongen is een van de vijftien mensen die Letty Berk als vrijwilligster van Stuurpunt Vluchtelingen De Bilt onder haar hoede heeft. 'Ik ga mee om het huurcontract te tekenen en de uitkering aan te vragen. Ik fiets een keer mee naar de Jumbo, wijs de weg naar de huisarts, de apotheek. Mij kunnen ze altijd bellen. Laatst heb ik een gezin met een



Mareille Suylen en Letty Berk (met bestelauto) bezoeken zich om de vluchtelingen in De Bilt. FOTO: WILDE ALLESTEE

zieke baby naar het ziekenhuis gereden. Dan blijft ik ook. Moet mijn man met een leenwoning naar de schouwburg.'

Op het bankje zit één Syriër te wachten op het spreekuur. 'Ik woon naast de Lidl', vertelt hij. Bestuurster Mareille Suylen: 'Kilo's formulieren vullen we in, met steeds dezelfde gegevens. Maar op het spreekuur komen mensen ook met folders aansteken. Of ze die gewoon kunnen

weggeven. Soms zijn het zorgkindjes, kennen ze de waar de van de euro niet. Een Syriër ging steeds per taxi naar het ziekenhuis, in zijn land is dat goedkoper dan een busrit.'

De Eritrese jongen slaapt nog een nachtje in het aze, vertelt Letty. 'Zijn bed komt pas woensdag van de kringloop. Dierlehands, stierlehands, ze zijn ergens vies van, maar ze willen wel graag een nieuw

matras. Begrijpelijk. In de opvang lagen ze ook al anderhalf jaar op de vleken van voorgangers. De huisinrichting moesten ze trouwens terugbetalen aan de bijstand, hé!'

Herfstvakantie is het. De oma's Berk en Suylen storten zich op hun kleinkinderen. 'Maar ik heb die Eritrese gekoppeld aan een landgenoot van 35 jaar, hier in de Bilt. Ze hadden een kille. Heb ik hem de buurtgenoot uitgelept, en geleid de achttienjarige eruit.'

Kokenpannen heeft hij al, weet ze. 'Wacht!', gaat ze een keertje, moe en wekt uit een doos vol. 'Ga ik hem zo invroegen. Een bestekesje, ja.'

Het is een hogere cursus inburgeren, constateert Mareille met humor. 'Kan hij er vast aan wennen dat het in Nederland anders toegaat dan in zijn geboorteland. Hier krijgt het bezoek een korpje thee met een koekje. En nog een korpje thee. En misschien nog een koekje. Maar mee-eten, ho maar!'



Figure 5: Newspaper article: Case 5: Bild

Seite 2  
**Bild KOMMENTAR**

## Schatten auf Sommermärchen

Von MATTHIAS BRÜGELMANN

Die WM 2006 haben wir alle in bester Erinnerung. Denn es war viel mehr als ein Fußball-Turnier.

Es war ein wunderschönes Fest, bei dem wir Deutschen uns vier Wochen lang als weltoffene, tolerante, fröhliche Gastgeber präsentiert haben.

Doch plötzlich fällt ein langer Schatten auf das Sommermärchen!

Der „Spiegel“ berichtet von einer schwarzen Kasse, mit der die WM gekauft worden sein soll. Angeblich 6,7 Millionen Euro, um Stimmen für Deutschland zu beschaffen.

Es wäre ein Skandal, der unseren Fußball in seinen Grundfesten erschüttern würde.

Der DFB mit Präsident Wolfgang Niersbach an der Spitze muss jetzt umgehend für Aufklärung sorgen.

Die Fans haben ein Recht darauf zu erfahren, was an den schweren Vorwürfen dran ist.

# Flüchtlingsstreit – Türkei lehnt EU-Mil

Brüssel – Drei Milliarden Euro und Visafreiheit für die Türkei – das bietet die EU, damit die Türken den Flüchtlingsstrom nach Europa bremsen!

Aber was ist dieser „Aktionsplan“, über den die Regierungen beim EU-Gipfel beraten, wert?

Fest steht: Bundesregierung und Türkei Regierung sind skeptisch.

Denn: Unklar ist, ob Ankara den Flüchtlings-Zustrom wirklich stoppen kann. Bis Mitte Oktober landeten 473 000 Flüchtlinge auf den griechischen Inseln. Die Türkei müsste die Kontrollen massiv Flüchtlingsboote. Berdem hieß es Milliarden-Angebot niedrig und „inak

## Vorbild Bayern? Seehofers Sprüche zur Asyl-Politik im Fakten-Check

Gibt in Sachen Flüchtlingskrise gern den harten Hund: Bayerns Ministerpräsident und CSU-Chef Horst Seehofer (66)

# GROSSE KLAPPE, NIX DAHINTER?

Kosovo-Flüchtlinge bei der Abschiebung am Flughafen München

### 1. Politiker fordert Bundeswehr soll bei Abschiebungen helfen

Berlin – Die Bundeswehr soll helfen, abgelehnte Asylbewerber in ihre Heimatländer abzuschieben! Das fordert CDU-Politiker Andreas Maffeldt (46). Begründung: Weil Bus- und zivile Fluglinien nicht ausreichen könnten,

um die große Zahl zu bewältigen, müsse der Einsatz der Luftwaffe beim Rücktransport geprüft werden. Maffeldt: „Wenn wir nicht schaffen, schnell abzuschieben, fliegt uns das Flüchtlingsthema bald um die Ohren.“ (km)

### „Wir müssen Flüchtlinge ohne Asylgrund viel schneller und vor allem konsequent abschieben“

Berlin – Er verkauft sich gern als bayerischer Löwe. Als Macher, der anpackt, statt nur zu reden! Und der Kanzlerin sogar mit „Notwehr“ droht, falls sie die Flüchtlingskrise nicht in den Griff kriegt.

„Für die Zuwanderung und ihre Grundlagen ist alleine der Bund zuständig“, drohte CSU-Chef Horst Seehofer (66) Donnerstag vor dem Landtag in München. Seehofers Botschaft: Nur „Die in Berlin“ sind verantwortlich für die Flüchtlingskrise! Und „ER in Bayern“ macht – natürlich – alles richtig!

Aber stimmt das wirklich? BILD macht den Sprüche-Check, prüft Seehofers Versprechen: „Flüchtlinge ohne Asylgrund viel schneller und vor allem konsequent abschieben!“

FAKT ist: Für die Abschiebung sind alleine die Länder verantwortlich – und nicht der Bund!

Seehofer könnte also ganz schnell abschieben, wenn er will.

Die Zahlen sprechen aber eine andere Sprache: In Bayern leben 62 391 abgelehnte Asylbewerber (Stand Ende Juni 2015).

In diesem Jahr wurden im Freistaat aber gerade mal 2900 abgeschoben!

Gemessen an der Zahl abgelehnter Asylbewerber ist Bayerns Abschiebebilanz also ziemlich mau.

Auch in Bayern (er-)finden viele abgelehnte Asylbewerber immer neue Gründe, um in Deutschland zu bleiben, melden sich krank oder reiteunfähig, spekulieren auf eine „Duldung“ oder klagten gegen den Bescheid. Und erreichen so eine langwierige Prüfung durch Gerichte.

Das weiß eigentlich auch Horst Seehofer! Es gibt auch bei unseren Behörden und den Verfahrensabläufen einiges zu verbessern“, gestand er jüngst in BILD und versprach: „Das werden wir unverzüglich angehen.“

UND WAS SOLL DANN DIE SPRÜCHEKLOPFERE?

Bayerns Regierungschef spürt die Konkurrenz der rechtspopulistischen „Alternative für Deutschland“ (AfD) im Nacken.

„Was der Ministerpräsident veranstaltet, ist ein Amoklauf“, urteilte Forsa-Chef Manfred Güllner (75) in „Focus“. Denn: Mit seiner radikalen Rhetorik treibe Seehofer „die CSU-Wähler zur AfD“.

Fakt ist: Bei der letzten Wählerumfrage kam die AfD in Bayern schon auf 6 %. Und Seehofers CSU rutschte auf 43 % ab – Rekordtief seit 2008 ...

## POLITIK & WIRTSCHAFT

### Neuer Müll-Rekord

Berlin – Jeder Bundesbürger produzierte 2014 im Schnitt 212,5 Kilo Verpackungsmüll – 25 Kilo mehr als 2003 und so viel wie nie. Ein Grund: immer mehr Bestellungen über das Internet (Bundesregierung).

### Vermögen 5 Mrd. rauf

Frankfurt/M. – Die Vermögen der Deutschen (Sparbuch, Aktien etc.) legten von April bis Juni um 5 Milliarden (0,1 %) Euro auf 5224 Milliarden Euro zu – langsamster Anstieg seit gut 20 Jahren, ermittelte die Bundesbank.

### Mehr Hilfen für Familien

Wiesbaden – Die CDU-Fraktionen mehrerer Bundesländer fordern mehr Unterstützung für Familien mit vielen Kindern. U. a. soll es mehr günstige Wohnungen sowie verbilligte Familien-Eintrittskarten (Museum, Freibad) geben.

### AfD schließt Funktionär aus

Magdeburg – Die Alternative für Deutschland (AfD) schließt in Sachsen-Anhalt einen Kreisfunktionär aus. Der Mann hatte mehrfach im Internet dazu aufgerufen, politische Gegner „an die Wand zu stellen“.

ANGST VOR JOB-ABBAU  
**Kanzleramt schaltet sich in**

## GERMANS TURN

Shut-out... protesters fight against border control laws in Saxony.

**GERMANY** was in turmoil last night as Angela Merkel's power crumbled over her open-door policy on migrants.

Two weeks ago the Chancellor was hailed a humanitarian hero for opening the floodgates of distressed Syrians to Germany. But in the night the mood had shifted from welcome to anger. Protesters were shouting slogans like 'Merkel is a traitor' and 'Merkel is a whore'.

The Chancellor's decision to open the borders to refugees was a gamble. It was a gamble that she had lost. The night of the protests, Merkel's popularity had fallen to its lowest point in her five years in office.

**Hamlet for 100 suffers 1,000 influx**

Suffer... Merkel with migrants.

A GERMAN border town of 100 people has suffered the influx of 1,000 migrants in the last 24 hours. The town is a small village in the north of Germany. The influx of migrants has caused a major crisis for the town. The town's residents are struggling to cope with the influx of migrants. The town's infrastructure is being overwhelmed. The town's residents are being forced to live in tents and makeshift shelters.

The influx of migrants has caused a major crisis for the town. The town's residents are struggling to cope with the influx of migrants. The town's infrastructure is being overwhelmed. The town's residents are being forced to live in tents and makeshift shelters.

The influx of migrants has caused a major crisis for the town. The town's residents are struggling to cope with the influx of migrants. The town's infrastructure is being overwhelmed. The town's residents are being forced to live in tents and makeshift shelters.

The influx of migrants has caused a major crisis for the town. The town's residents are struggling to cope with the influx of migrants. The town's infrastructure is being overwhelmed. The town's residents are being forced to live in tents and makeshift shelters.

## AGAINST LEADER OVER IMMIGRATION

Only... and more than 100,000 people have entered Germany in a month.

# MERKEL 'Mummy' to 'People Smuggler'

Baby injured as neo-Nazis stone church.

A BABY was injured as neo-Nazis stoned a church in Saxony. The church was a small, stone building. The neo-Nazis were a group of people who were protesting against the influx of migrants. They were throwing stones at the church. The baby was injured when a stone hit her. The church was damaged. The neo-Nazis were arrested.

**200,000**  
asylum seekers have entered Germany in a month.

**800,000**  
estimated to arrive this year, although this may hit 1.5m if families come.

**£33BN**  
estimated annual cost of supporting refugees in Germany.



## Hypotheses for alternative media and found evidence in sample 1

Table 2: Article from Het Parool- Comments on outcome of testing the hypotheses

	Description/ Hypothesis	Comments on outcome of testing the hypotheses
1	<p>The article provides alternatives to dominant repressive perspectives that reflect the rule</p> <p>of capital and/ or</p> <p>of patriarchy and/or</p> <p>of racism and/or</p> <p>of sexism and/or</p> <p>of nationalism.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Title: critique of nationalism or rather of an isolation of states from others with the aim to protect themselves</li> <li>- By doing that, the governments exclude and thereby suppress those in need (refugees)</li> <li>- Refugees are potential subject of a counter-movement</li> <li>- Domination: countries suppressing proletariat</li> <li>- Bad world outside is threatening dominative structures</li> <li>➔ Article takes position against wall-building</li> <li>- “De natiestaat moet worden beschermt”</li> <li>➔ No alternative to nationalism</li> <li>- Reflection of rule of capital: -</li> <li>- Reflection of rule of patriarchy/ sexism: -</li> <li>- Reflection of rule of racism: -</li> </ul>
2	<p>In the article, the voices of the oppressed, dominated, enslaved, estranged and exploited are represented.</p> <p>Sub-hypothesis:</p> <p>2.1 Based on unequal division of resources, the article expresses the materialistic interests of the dominated.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- author of the article mentions that the flight is more dangerous with the walls</li> <li>- no comment on materialistic interests</li> </ul>
3	<p>The ideal of a participatory democracy and of a co-operative society is manifested in the article.</p> <p>Sub-hypotheses:</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Emphasis on ideal missing: Not saying: we should work together instead of against each other</li> </ul>

	<p>3.1) The article proposes possibilities of change with regard to obtaining the ideal situation.</p> <p>3.2) The article deconstructs ideals saying things can't be changed.</p> <p>3.3) In the article, social struggles are advanced.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Possible development: Workers that are intended to be excluded will be needed eventually ➔ but this is a pragmatic consideration, not idealistic as demanded by Fuchs</li> <li>- No support of social struggles</li> </ul>
4	The article presents phenomena including contradictory, open and dynamic aspects and mentions possible development potentials they carry in them.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Different citations saying that walls have various intentions, but do not really protect from refugees</li> <li>- Development potential: Refugees will be needed eventually</li> </ul>

*Table 3: Article from die Tageszeitung- Comments on outcome of testing the hypotheses*

	Description/ Hypothesis	Comments on outcome of testing the hypotheses
1	<p>The article provides alternatives to dominant repressive perspectives that reflect the rule</p> <p>of capital and/ or</p> <p>of patriarchy and/or</p> <p>of racism and/or</p> <p>of sexism and/or</p> <p>of nationalism.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Repressive perspectives: Administration agencies stand in the way of education for refugees</li> <li>- "Die Hochschule rechtfertigt sich"</li> <li>- „Wissensabfrage wäre sehr aufwendig. Man müsste für jedes Fachsemester eine eigene Prüfung erstellen.“</li> <li>- Wille da, doch Bürokratie setzt Grenzen – Bürokratie als Obrigkeit</li> <li>- Reflection of rule of capital: -</li> <li>- Reflection of rule of patriarchy/ sexism: -</li> <li>- Reflection of rule of racism: -</li> </ul>
2	In the article, the voices of the oppressed, dominated, enslaved, estranged and exploited are represented.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ein Modell für alle: geringe Kosten</li> <li>- They are given second hand notenooks</li> <li>- Wovon soll er das bezahlen? Darf nicht arbeiten.</li> </ul>

2.1	<p>Sub-hypothesis:</p> <p>Based on unequal division of resources, the article expresses the materialistic interests of the dominated.</p>	
3	<p>The ideal of a participatory democracy and of a co-operative society is manifested in the article.</p> <p>Sub-hypotheses:</p> <p>3.1) The article proposes possibilities of change with regard to obtaining the ideal situation.</p> <p>3.2) The article deconstructs ideals saying things can't be changed.</p> <p>3.3) In the article, social struggles are advanced.</p>	<p>- „Es geht auch anders“</p> <p>- „Ein Modell für alle“</p> <p>“Man müsste für jedes Fachsemester eine eigene Prüfung erstellen” – hört sich nach „geht gar nicht“ an</p> <p>Ausblick in die Zukunft „Neben Magdeburg sollen zwei weitere Zentren entstehen, an denen Eignungstests und Sprachkurse angeboten werden: Diese sollen in Köthen sowie in Merseburg oder Halle eröffnet werden. 4,7 Millionen Euro stellt das Land bis 2018 dafür bereit.“</p> <p>No social struggles are advanced explicitly, yet Mohammeds life is reported on and his personal struggle with German administration</p> <p>Represents struggle of all refugees</p>
4	<p>The article presents phenomena including contradictory, open and dynamic aspects and mentions possible development potentials they carry in them.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Umfang des Problems nicht erkannt: Hinweis auf (fehlende) Dialektik im Umgang mit dem Problem</li> <li>- Emphasis on possible development potentials (how it already works in other places)</li> </ul>

*Table 4: Article from The Guardian- Comments on outcome of testing the hypotheses*

	Description/ Hypothesis	Comments on outcome of testing the hypotheses
1	<p>The article provides alternatives to dominant repressive perspectives that reflect the rule</p> <p>of capital and/ or</p> <p>of patriarchy and/or</p> <p>of racism and/or</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Pegida as racist group –opposed</li> <li>- For example by:</li> <li>- Colourful banners hung between the masts at the front of the baroque house read: ‘Open your eyes’, ‘Open your hears’ and ‘The dignity of humans is sacrosanct’, large white LED screen flashes the message: ‘We’re not a backdrop for intolerance’ ➔ Reflection of rule of racism (and nationalism)</li> <li>- Reflection of rule of capital: -</li> </ul>

	<p>of sexism and/or</p> <p>of nationalism.</p>	<p>- Reflection of rule of patriarchy/ sexism: -</p>
2	<p>In the article, the voices of the oppressed, dominated, enslaved, estranged and exploited are represented.</p> <p>Sub-hypothesis:</p> <p>Based on unequal division of resources, the article expresses the materialistic interests of the dominated.</p>	<p>- No evidence found</p>
2.1		
3	<p>The ideal of a participatory democracy and of a co-operative society is manifested in the article.</p> <p>Sub-hypotheses:</p> <p>3.1) The article proposes possibilities of change with regard to obtaining the ideal situation.</p> <p>3.2) The article deconstructs ideals saying things can't be changed.</p> <p>3.3) In the article, social struggles are advanced.</p>	<p>- Colourful banners hung between the masts at the front of the baroque house read: 'Open your eyes', 'Open your hears' and 'The dignity of humans is sacrosanct', large white LED screen flashes the message: 'We're not a backdrop for intolerance' and 'We're not a stage set for xenophobia'.</p> <p>➔ Manifested ideal</p> <p>3.2) Online-campaign #IchBinDresden</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- I'm one of more than 500 000 Dresdeners who don't go to Pegida.</li> <li>- So far little effect</li> <li>- "We are at a loss to find the right recipe to effectively oppose Pegida", Silvio Lang, spokesman of the association Nazi Free Dresden admits</li> <li>- How could things become? "If the government can give people the feeling they are in control again, that those who should protect them are doing so, that might take the wind out of the sails of the protest. But I do not believe the far right is strong enough to turn this to their advantage."</li> </ul>

4	<p>The article presents phenomena including contradictory, open and dynamic aspects and mentions possible development potentials they carry in them.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Try to explain the problems of Pegida: „He defines the protesters as the “verbitterte Mitte”, the embittered centre, who lost their sense of “Heimat”, or belonging when communism collapsed and have never found it again.”</li> <li>- “This region is something of a test lab for a low-wage economy. People are often not represented by a trade union. Neither do they belong to a church.”</li> <li>- “For many their strongest sense of belonging came from the football club Dynamo Dresden.”</li> <li>- Relativization: Timo Lochocki, analyst of European Populism and fellow at the German Marshall Fund thinktank, says it’s necessary to consider how radically Germany has changed over the past 20 years, to understand the sentiments. ‘It’s far more open, more European, more multicultural and within just a matter of weeks Germany has thrown its migration policies of decades out the window. The psychological impact this is having on people is completely understandable. <b>The next six months, he believes, will be crucial. (possible development potentials</b></li> </ul> <p>➔ Many perspectives explaining the rising of Pegida</p>
---	--	---

## Hypotheses for traditional media and found evidence in sample 2

Table 5: Article from De Telegraaf- Comments on outcome of testing the hypotheses

Description/ Hypothesis	Comments on outcome of testing the hypotheses
-------------------------	---

1	<p><b>“Ideological content”</b></p> <p>The content of the article is strictly defined by what is considered popular and sellable, for example by resorting to emotionalism and sensationalism.</p> <p>The article condones a lack of quality, complexity and sophistication by focussing on singular examples.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Emotionalism and sensationalism not employed in striking manner</li> <li>- Not focussing on one example: showing both protestors against refugees and people who are ready to help refugees</li> </ul> <p>Not simplifying reality, but trying to explain why such racist groups emerged:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Sociologist says: gap between good- and bad earning people: people that are less educated are more concerned with housing and social welfare benefits</li> <li>- So in the end it's a question of competition: they experience it more closely, more immediate on the job market, or when searching for a social rented flat</li> <li>- People with a better education don't notice refugees much</li> <li>- Barely get in touch with newcomers</li> <li>- Most of the politicians are well educated – you should ask yourself if the representatives of the people shouldn't mirror the people more.</li> </ul> <p>➔ Quite critical</p>
2	<p>In the article, structures of domination are not questioned but rather fostered.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Anti-refugee- group ➔ author of article takes rather oppositional standpoint</li> <li>- Utrecht: they are suggesting a different possibility: enquêtes</li> <li>- Fractievoorzitter Frank van Liempdt van Lokaal Liberaal: against the reception of refugees</li> <li>- But if most of the people has no problems with refugees, who are we to be still against it? I am a representative of the people!</li> </ul> <p>➔ This does not foster structures of domination</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- referendum would be more honest, because the enquête can be filled in several times</li> <li>➔ this is a proposal for more participation on a local level ➔ alternative criteria, not traditional</li> <li>- Right under the article: “Wel graag een nieuw matras”</li> </ul>

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- How do these mostly poorly educated people deal with the refugees? Claim in the first article: Perceive them as competitors</li> <li>- Woman understands how Refugees feels</li> <li>- Onder haar hoede – she’s signing rental contracts, help them with asking for social benefits <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➔ No fostering of domination pattern</li> <li>➔ Towards Fuchs’ ideal of cooperation</li> </ul> </li> <li>- They also want to teach him Dutch culture, the visit gets tea and cookies but isn’t invited for dinner</li> </ul>
--	--	--

*Table 6: Article from Bild- Comments on outcome of testing the hypotheses*

	Description/ Hypothesis	Comments on outcome of testing the hypotheses
1	<p>“Ideological content”</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The content of the article is strictly defined by what is considered popular and sellable, for example by resorting to emotionalism and sensationalism.</li> </ul> <p>The article condones a lack of quality, complexity and sophistication by focussing on singular examples.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Claim: „wir müssen Flüchtlinge ohne Asylgrund viel schneller und vor allem konsequent abschieben“</li> <li>- Vorbild Bayern? Seehofers Sprüche zur Asyl-Politik im Fakten-Check.</li> <li>- „facts“ prove that Seehofer doesn’t do enough to make refugees go home quicker <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➔ Disappointment, anger</li> </ul> </li> <li>- Lack of quality, complexity, sophistication: yes <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➔ Singular example: what did Seehofer say and what is true about it?</li> <li>➔ More interesting and necessary to give a more complete picture of the issue: how does deportation work? What are the criteria that give refugees the right to stay?</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
2	<p>In the article, structures of domination are not questioned but rather fostered.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Very true: not mentioning refugees’ position, only focussing on idea that they must be deported back quicker</li> </ul>

Table 7: Article from *The Sun*- Comments on outcome of testing the hypotheses

	Description/ Hypothesis	Comments on outcome of testing the hypotheses
1	<p>"Ideological content"</p> <p>The content of the article is strictly defined by what is considered popular and sellable, for example by resorting to emotionalism and sensationalism.</p> <p>The article condones a lack of quality, complexity and sophistication by focussing on singular examples.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Germans turn against leader over immigration → Very one-sided</li> <li>- Just giving numbers → Lack of complexity</li> <li>- Generalizing: "Germans" → Lack of quality → Too radical, not sophisticated</li> <li>- Emotionalism → Mummy, People Smuggler, Traitor, Hero</li> </ul>
2	<p>In the article, structures of domination are not questioned but rather fostered.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Why aren't people mentioned who give reasons why this policy is good and necessary? No dialectical presentation, no questioning.</li> <li>- Frauke Petry, of right-wing Alternative for Germany party, said: "Merkel has invited the victims of civil war from all over the world. This is completely irresponsible."</li> <li>- precisely this behaviour makes her responsible in Christian Fuchs' sense → Anti-nationalist</li> <li>- Taking responsibility for Germanys involvement in civil wars in middle east → Article positioning on side of people turning their backs at Merkel</li> <li>- Right-wing movement and possible new dangers uncriticised</li> <li>- baby injured as neo-Nazis stone church</li> <li>- On one hand against migration, on the other hand if a baby is injured by Neonazis that's inhuman.</li> </ul> <p>Yes, questioning of domination takes place: Questioning Merkel</p>



		<p>But here, “the Germans” turning their back against Merkel’s immigration policy seem to be the domination whereas everyone supporting her might be seen as leftist counter-sphere</p> <p>Germans turn against leader over immigration</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Analysts warn the nation is tearing itself apart, last night branding Merkel’s soft-touch Germany “A hippy state rules by its feelings:”</li> <li>- Fuchs would rather take it as a compliment</li> </ul>
--	--	--